

1. EMOTIONS EAST AND WEST: TEMPERAMENT, EMOTION AND ‘FRIGHTFULNESS’ IN MEDIEVAL RULERSHIP: THE PARALLEL CASES OF CHARLES THE BOLD AND MEHMED II

COLIN HEYWOOD
(Maritime Historical Studies Centre, University of Hull)

Comparative perspectives on emotions east and west in a late medieval context are somewhat difficult to achieve: a lack of comparable sources, or even of comparable individual subjects for study, make the historian’s task a far from easy one. However, there are opportunities to be grasped, where both the availability of sources and the existence of synchronically and situationally comparable subjects do exist. Obviously, the higher one mounts the ladder of society, the richer the pickings; the ripest fruit of all being found at the top of the tree, in the persons of those late medieval rulers who, from their achievements and failures, have generated the greatest volume of contemporary comment. From this some fruitful insights into what might be called their emotional life can be obtained – entering, in other words, into a form, even if not a highly developed one, of psycho-historical investigation.¹

For the mid- to later fifteenth century, in the context of East and West, and of direct and illuminating comparisons, two commanding figures of the age stand out, directly comparable in chronology, temperament and in their psycho-historical givens: the Ottoman sultan Mehmed II, and the last Valois Duke of Burgundy, Charles the Bold.

In the 1460s and 70s both the Ottoman state and the Burgundian lands were governed by strong-willed rulers, both devoted to warfare and incessantly on campaign, and both manifesting, in the utterances ascribed to them, pretensions to universal and even to world rule. Both states, in 1470, had reasonable prospects of becoming major powers and of enduring for centuries. And yet, by 1477 the Burgundian state had ceased to exist. Charles the Bold, incessantly pursuing a course of expansion, had fallen in battle against the Swiss mountain league, leaving no direct male heir. Mehmed II, on the other hand, had succeeded in vanquishing the Ak-Koyunlu ruler Uzun Hasan his own bitterest opponent and most dangerous Anatolian rival, in the battle of Terjan (Otluk Beli) in 1473, and at his death in 1481 left a state, and an empire, which endured for more than four centuries.

How had this come about when the two rulers seemingly had so much in common, at least in terms of their historical psychology and complex emotional status? Are we in order to compare them? The present paper, built around a cento of quotations on the character, emotions and personality of Charles the Bold, taken from ‘épopée néogothique’ of the ten-volume *Histoire des ducs de Bourgogne* [1824] by the early nineteenth-century French civil servant, *académicien*, and amateur historian Amable Burgière, baron de Barante, will attempt to do exactly that by tying them to the exact parallels to be found in Ottoman and western sources for the life and career of Mehmed II.²

¹ This paper draws largely on the work of Zevedei Barbu, *Problems of Historical Psychology* (London, 1960), especially Chapter III (pp. 43-68), ‘History and Emotional Climates’.

² Amable-Guillaume-Prospér Burgière, baron de Barante, *Histoire des ducs de Bourgogne de la maison de Valois, 1364-1477* [1826] (10 vols., Bruxelles, 1839).

2. Mourning in Person: Expressions of Grief in Middle-period Chinese Funerary Art

Representations of intense emotions are rare in the Chinese visual tradition. Although they do exist, visual representations of the socially recognized “seven emotions (*qiqing*)” from antiquity—pleasure, anger, sorrow, fear, love, hate, and desire—are much more demure in comparison with their counterpart in literary convention. While the reasons for this deserve an in-depth interdisciplinary study, such general reservation contrastingly highlights a distinct visual phenomenon that emerged and flourished from the tenth to the thirteenth centuries. This time period witnessed a growing number of visual representations of highly expressive mourning or weeping figures in funerary and religious (mainly Buddhist) contexts. Recognizing this phenomenon as unique to this time period, this paper examines these images in terms of their association with contemporary social and cultural practices.

Two sets of contemporaneous images are the main focus of my discussion: images of the so-called “Twenty-four exemplars of filial piety” that prominently present weeping figures framed in relevant episodes, and images of mourning monks within Nirvana (Death of the Buddha) scenes carved on the surface of reliquaries. These seemingly disparate examples, in terms of their themes, share a strikingly similar level of intensity in expressing grief, connected by the common cause of their emotion, i.e., death. Furthermore, even though the subjects themselves were not new in the visual field by this time period, the conspicuously vivid depiction of mourners suggests a newly emerging contemporary desire to express corporeal, explicit emotion associated with death, as opposed to the socially coded reticence common in traditional Chinese art.

By framing these examples within a single category of the contemporary interest in representing the particular emotion of sorrow and grief, I examine underlying social and cultural conditions that prompted desire for such visual representations. In both cases of filial exemplars and weeping monks, a certain degree of personification is evident at two levels. While the crying figures in the Nirvana images imply fictional “portraits” of living—and most likely local—monks, the mourning figures in the filial exemplars suggest their allusion to dramatic performances increasing in popularity during this time. I argue that this “inserting” of a fictional or localized mourner into the given thematic formulae serves as a channel through which corporeal and raw, as opposed to ritualized, emotions are effectively transmitted into the specific ritual spaces, i.e., the tomb and crypt underneath a pagoda. In so doing, this inquiry reveals a unique ritual role that the visual representations of the particular emotion played in middle-period China.

3.

Ms Kirsi Kanerva

MA, PhD-Student in Cultural History

University of Turku

Email: kirsi.kanerva@utu.fi

Abstract for the international conference *The Cultural History of Emotions in Pre-modernity II: Emotions East and West*, September 29th to October 1st, 2011, Bilkent University, Istanbul, Turkey.

Title of the proposed paper: The Exceptional Tears: Aspects of Male Expression of Grief in Medieval Iceland.

In my paper, I will depart from a “surprising” discovery in one medieval Icelandic saga called *Íslendinga saga*: in this text, tears of grief are shed by a man. The saga has been written at the end of the thirteenth century or some time around the year 1300 and describes the events that took place in the end of the twelfth and at the beginning of the thirteenth century, being one of the so-called contemporary sagas (samtiðarsögur). In this saga, a man called Gizurr is described as shedding tears for his dead wife and son. Though the family members die accidentally, when the enemies of Gizurr are trying to burn him in his own house, this is extraordinary since tears of men seem to be rather lacking in medieval Icelandic literature. Another saga, *Egíls saga Skalla-Grimssonar* that was written around 1230 and describes events that took place over 200 years before the saga was compiled, gives a completely different kind of account on a similar event. When the son of Egill accidentally drowns, it is never mentioned that he would shed tears for his son’s death. However, his decision to lock himself up alone in his room and neglect any kind of food and drink can be seen as a kind of expression of his sorrow and bereavement. I will focus on these differences in the representations of grief and discuss the meaning that the tears or lack of them in both occasions conveyed, that is, how they may have been interpreted by the thirteenth- and fourteenth-century Icelanders who read and listened to these texts.

4. THE CULTURAL HISTORY OF EMOTIONS IN PRE-MODERNITY II EMOTIONS OF EAST AND WEST Istanbul, September 29-October 1, 2011

The Tracing of Emotions in Early Modern Swedish Graves

In this paper I would like to discuss theoretical, methodological as well as contextual concerns regarding the study of emotions through material culture. In my PhD project *Man and Death in Early Modern Sweden* (AD 1500-1800) I explore the attitudes towards death and the relationship between the dead and the living by studying the material remnants of the burial rituals, i.e. the graves themselves.

Throughout the early modern period the preparation of the body was performed in the home of the deceased. The procedures may have looked a bit different between social groups, but what all have in common is the display of the body before the funeral – either during the wake or when the body was placed in the coffin. The body was then usually kept at home awaiting the funeral. The stages of preparing and the possibility of seeing the body must have enabled the bereaved to physically relate to the dead body before the separation of burial. By looking at how the dead body was prepared, dressed, adorned and equipped in the coffin I want to reach attitudes to death and the dead body through time.

Rituals - such as the preparation and viewing of the dead body – are collective acts legitimized by the collective. The formality of the ritual sets standards for the appropriate way of acting and showing emotions towards the deceased. Emotions are partly constructed through material practice, and if certain emotions correspond with the values of society, they will be created and recreated. It is therefore my assumption that recurring patterns in graves bear witness of a collective cultural understanding. These patterns may mirror the reflected or unspoken collective attitudes towards death.

Material metaphors play an important part in rituals by linking the unintelligible with the experience of concrete sensory impressions. By studying the re-description of the metaphor we can reach associations ascribed to death and thereby get closer to the emotions the participants were meant to feel. A case study performed on graves of burghers and nobility in the 18th century showed for example how the inter-sensorial metaphors of sleep, celebration and wedding in the way the dead were presented in the coffin were used to re-describe death in terms of well known, familiar and even joyous concepts from daily life.

Whereas recurring patterns in graves may tell us of a collective cultural understanding, I believe that deviations to these patterns may tell us of actions triggered by individual emotional responses; actions not necessarily performed or supported within the collective context of the ritual. In well preserved graves inside churches it is sometimes possible to tell if objects were hidden or visible inside the coffin. This method is one way of exploring what objects were officially sanctioned to follow the dead. Interesting contrasts can also be made to which objects were used when depicting the dead on epitaph paintings.

Objects included in the coffin can tell us of a need to relate to the deceased. Mundane objects previously used by the dead person such as a snuff box, clay pipes or a particular book have after death become emotionally meaningful and are in actions towards the dead body used to recreate a relationship. Emotionally loaded objects can become extensions of the body and therefore of personhood. The dead being unable to communicate, personhood is inferred from the outside by the bereaved – and fragments of a relationship can be recreated.

East and west – tears and cultural identity in Polybios

Taking as starting point the Greek Historian Polybios' work *Histories*, this paper will discuss Roman and Greek tears during the Hellenistic period. As a historical source, Polybios is in a unique position to convey emotional expressions from public and political settings. Having been a Greek politician with in-depth knowledge of international affairs and political manners, Polybios was taken as a hostage to Rome. During the later part of his life, Polybios became both the tutor and adherer to the young and ambitious Scipio Aemilianus, who was to emerge as the leading politician and general of his generation. Being a Romanised Greek fraternising with Hellenised Romans, Polybios, together with Scipio, one writing history, the other making history, formed a cultural intersection. The pair of them embodies both the convergence and the dissonance of the Greek and Roman worlds, the east and the west.

From a fundamental theoretical position, the paper argues that tears should not mainly (or only) be viewed as literary devices, or motifs, *topoi*, as some scholars contend. Rather it is here argued that the literary descriptions of tears should be read as what might be termed "cultural *topoi*", in which literary descriptions and actual "historical" behaviours reflect the same sets of ideas, mentalities, attitudes, dispositions, behaviours, practices and so on. Accordingly, an understanding of tears necessitates an understanding of the contexts in which they occur, both historical and literary. An enquiry into the history of tears is therefore a legitimate, as well as a fruitful, endeavour for the ancient historian.

Tears and crying might be typologised in different categories (tears of sadness, joy supplication etcetera). The cases where multiple categorises overlap emerge as the most telling of the inherent ambiguous nature of tears. All in all, in the extant work of Polybios, tears are represented some fifteen times. While giving an overview of weeping in Polybios, this paper is principally concerned with how tears of different cultures are portrayed in the author's work. Are Roman tears portrayed differently from Greek? What about other people, "barbarians"? What variances can we discern and how should we understand them? Are the perceived differences based on literary or historical circumstances? To put Polybios in relief, some short comparisons will be made with other authors, mainly Livy, who covers the same period and some of the same (or similar) events in detail. Livy represents in Latin a distinctly Roman perspective. Putting Polybios beside Livy, makes it possible to ask what differences are distinguishable in their descriptions of the crying of different cultures. If the same (or similar) historical event is depicted differently by different authors, we can conclude that the literary context is most likely the determining factor in shaping these variations.

It will be argued that, depending on the circumstances, shedding tears was sometimes womanish and in some ways "Greek" in a bad way for a Roman. In the right circumstances, however, crying was the proper thing to do. It is concluded that by crying, properly, and at the right time, the politician could, also by alluding to former famous criers, efficiently strengthen his own public image in Rome. And that, in a way, the proper Roman tears were Greek.

6. PUBLIC DISPLAY OF GRIEF: 16TH CENTURY OTTOMAN ROYAL FUNERALS

Zeynep Yelçe (Sabancı University)

This paper explores the public displays of grief in the face of royal deaths in sixteenth-century Ottoman society. Approaching the various ritual moments related to death – such as the announcement of death, the transportation of the corpse, the funeral and the aftermath – through the perspective of “transition rites” the aim is to conceptualize the role of grief, especially in its violent reflections, within the process of succession and re-making of order.

Contemporary Ottoman chronicles convey a sense of heavy grief and mourning through uncontrolled behavior during royal funerals. Laments, wailing and violent acts of grief such as tearing one’s clothes, beating one’s chest, throwing soil on one’s head is a way to cope with the transient stage of death in various cultures. Extreme manifestations of grief in funerals, extending even to communal suicide as in the case of a few Roman emperors, point at an interruption in the order of things and thus causes a feeling of chaos, confusion and fear in those left behind. Not only the perceived political hiatus, but the reminder of the ephemerality of the life of the individual lay beneath the reaction. Such violent behavior, then, becomes a way to cope with these emotions and to re-enter the ordinary life.

Contemporary accounts also give an impression of the successor’s conduct during the funeral which stands in contrast to the violent demonstration of grief of others. The successor is never seen lamenting, wailing, beating his chest or engaging in any other violent behavior. Having accepted his father’s death as the will of God, thus as something to be accepted and endured, he cries in a noble manner. The chaotic wailing of lamenters creates a contrast to the calm tears of the sultan-to-be which suggests a contrast between chaos and order. However sincere these tears were, they should also be seen as “performative tears” meaning that they were shed at a “ritualized social situation” and had a discursive effect. In this context, the tears of the successor place him in a social position where as a son he cries for the loss of his father. This serves as a way of marking dynastic succession emphasizing the father-son relationship. The nobility of his weeping as opposed to the violent grieving of others places him in a political position where as a ruler he is in control of himself. This contrast serves as a way of differentiating him from the common people who are unable to control themselves.

In all, the whole process simultaneously entails a strong sense of an end and a beginning, chaos turning into order.

7.

Dr Nira Pancer

Department of General History

University of Haifa

Israel

Hello,

Here is my proposal to your conference. Thanks in advance for your answer.

Best regards,

Nira

"Scripts of Honor and Their Emotional Grammar in Merovingian conflicts

(VIth-VIIIth" centuries)

Contrarily to contemporary politics which often claim to be governed by reason, the Merovingian secular elite never conceived its political motivations in terms of rational interests, be they of economic, expansionist or ideological nature. On the contrary, the reading of the texts gives the impression that chaotic emotional outbursts generally followed by more or less violent responses were the very cause of conflicts. This reductive view is now outdated. Following G. Althoff, this paper is an attempt to reconstruct the emotional grammar of honor during the Merovingian period with a special attention to envy and jealousy as key emotions of conflicts. Based on this emotional grammar, one is able to decipher the various scripts of honor which structure the social and political dynamics.

8. On Pre-Modern Concepts of Envy

Paper proposal for the conference

The Cultural History of Emotions in Pre-modernity II - Emotions East and West

Istanbul 2011

Sinai Rusinek

Envy is a fierce, savage and ancient emotion. From a reading of the classical sources of religions, mythology and even of modern day science, we get the impression that it has been there, with us, from our very beginnings: envy between us and our parents, envy between brothers, between Gods, Gods and humans, and between fellow mortals. Often regarded as the worst and deadliest sin, it can lead to wars and catastrophes and disrupt the rational and natural order. It is, however, perceived as so deeply embedded in our human nature that it seems to be an essential part of this very order. But is it, in fact, so? Is the concept of envy really so immutable and so universal, beyond time, culture and context?

In the proposed presentation I wish to claim the opposite: that the concept of Envy is a historical and cultural variable, to a large degree dependant upon and constructed by the social, cultural, political and economic contexts in which it appears.

In early modernity, so it seems, the concept of envy had its heyday: sermons and pamphlets, poetry and theater were fascinated, if not obsessed with it. Probing the various prototypical characters, similes, metaphors and artistic representations, we find biblical envious protagonists, such as Cain and Joseph's brothers. But where early modernity found envy in the bible, one would not find the Hebrew word *קנא* (kin'a), the Greek *φθονος* (phthonos) or the Latin *invidia*, and it is a later, and a western concept of envy that is read into the ancient sources. Tracing this hermeneutic gap through the choices made by early modern translators and interpreters of the biblical texts can help us understand what envy had been, what it came to be in early modernity and why it was so important and threatening. Finally, by seeing what envy could be and what it can be used for may shed light on the significance of its waning presence in modern times.

9. Emotions and the Elizabethan Aristocracy: The Essays of Sir William Cornwallis
Kristine Steenbergh

Abstract

Cultural History of Emotions in Premodernity Conference, Istanbul
29 September – 1 October 2011

Sir William Cornwallis (c. 1579-1614) vies with Sir Francis Bacon for the title of the English first writer of familiar essays. Whereas Bacon's essays set out to create categories to think with, Cornwallis was inspired by Montaigne's more introspective style of writing. His *Essays* (1600 and 1601) - popular in the early seventeenth century, but now rarely studied – show how an Elizabethan knight struggled to reconcile his humanist and stoic ideals with the aristocratic honour code, providing an insight into processes of emotional reformation in early modern England.

England in the sixteenth century was in a process of transformation from a feudal and aristocratic state to a centralized parliamentary monarchy. The traditional military and political powers of the aristocracy were curtailed in this process. Some aristocratic factions resisted this process, and tried to find possibilities of resistance in chivalric traditions as well as Neo-Stoic Taciteanism. William Cornwallis can be seen to sympathize with these factions: he was knighted for his service in the Earl of Essex's campaign in Ireland and may have participated in Essex's rebellion upon his return.

Although Lawrence Stone's thesis of a crisis of the aristocracy in this period has been challenged in recent years, it is clear that the aristocracy in Elizabethan England did perceive itself to be in difficulty. The ideology that placed the warrior aristocrat at the head of society lost its cogency, and aristocrats lost the chivalric tradition that had structured their sense of worth. This process also entailed a change in thinking about the role of emotions in public life. In the two volumes of *Essays* published in 1600 and 1601, Cornwallis can be seen to struggle with the frictions between stoic ethics, traditional aristocratic honour codes and humanist values of civilization and education. In his essay on Patience, for example, Cornwallis writes "About nothing do I suffer greater conflict in my selfe then about induring wrongs." In an introspective essay he explains how his negligent flesh, his awareness of the need to revenge to safeguard his honour, but also his fears of the debilitating effects of anger, influence his decision not to avenge an insult. In the essay, Stoic and Christian disapproval of anger conflict with a sense of aristocratic honour which calls for an act of revenge can be seen to rub against each other in Cornwallis's meditations.

In my paper, I will examine such conflicts experienced by the aristocracy in this early modern reformation of emotions. Sir William Cornwallis' essays on subjects such as resolution, patience, love, suspicion, friendship and factions, love, discontentment, affection, humility, fear and sorrow form a unique source for the exploration of the role of emotions in a period in which the aristocracy was struggling to reinvent itself.

Children of Love. Emotions and Relations in Early Modern History.

The biological foundation of emotions as hormonally or genetically determined by birth and/or genealogical descent is a modern invention, often criticized especially by historians concerned with the history of gender and emotions. While looking at the history of childhood one learns almost instantaneously that childhood is most exclusively investigated as the history of parents and their biological children. This approach is highly misleading, as it projects a very modern and very brittle concept of childhood, defined by biological measures (such as age, too). In my paper I would like to reconsider the history of childhood as a history of emotional relations. More specifically I am interested in how emotional attachment (such as love) is used to qualify and create relations in (a) autobiographical writings and self-narratives of the arabic and western tradition and (b) in social conflicts negotiated before court.

As has been shown in a rather general survey of arabic autobiographical writings from the ninth to the 18th century, children's emotions become productive in many different respects (Reynolds, 1995). It becomes clear that emotional attachment is a prominent marker of happy relations, which adults claimed to have had to different persons during their own childhood, such as to siblings, teachers, neighbors, but also to Allah, to the sultan and so on. Since this kind of research has not been conducted for Western European societies, I would like to take Reynolds' observations as an inspiration for my reading of western self-narratives and court records. One of them is written by Glikl of Hameln (1646-1724), a jewish widow and trader, who has left behind extensive memoirs, in which she focuses – *inter alia* – on the importance of love as a highly performative mode in relations. Here she doesn't make a difference between marital, parental, children's or - generally spoken - social love. In a second step I would like to turn towards examples of social interaction from a different perspective, and I intend to investigate court records on conflicts between fathers and sons. Amazingly, sons argue that fathers ought to love their children according to the Bible. From here the most interesting debates blossom about the right to give or refuse love.

Finally it should become possible to deliberate the essential questions (i) of how emotions affect the building and the deconstruction of social relations in self-narratives and in social conflicts and (ii) of how notions of kinship generate specific notions of emotional attachment resp. detachment apart from biological pre-definitions of descent and age. (claudia.jarzebowski@fu-berlin.de).

11. FATHERHOOD AND CLIENTALISM: MEHMET RAGIP PASHA AND HIS SON

Dr. Aysel Yıldız (Post-Doctoral Researcher, Sabancı University)

An early modern polity meant limited degree of professionalization and institutionalization. Clientalism, therefore, prevailed over the early modern polity. During that period informal relations and clientalism were basic means of social mobility and employment. It created an endless web of informal relationship among various segments of society, both vertically and horizontally. Patron-client relationship resembles that of father-son relationship, but it is not always easy to figure out and to document historical examples combining clientalism and fatherhood.

Fatherly affection and patronage of Mehmed Ragıp Pasha (d. 1244/1828) to his son Tahir Efendi is one of the rare examples. His struggle to make his son nicknamed “Kof” (Empty Inside) to climb the social ladder and his efforts to gain a position for him is a good example bringing fatherhood and clientalism together and thus deserves a closer study.

This paper investigates the relationship between the feelings associated with being a father and the role of these relationships in political networking and clientalism.

**12. Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century Ottoman Biographies of Poets
and
the Banishment of Emotions from the Space of Writing**

**by
Zeynep Altok**

Istanbul Bilgi University, Department of Comparative Literature, instructor
Boğaziçi University, Department of History, Ph.D. student

Sixteenth-century Ottoman biographies of poets (*tezkiiretî 'ş-şu'arâ*) attest to a world where poetry, including the highly abstract love poems of the age-old ghazal tradition, was understood to be essentially autobiographical. The rich anecdotal passages in the *tezkiire*s present poems in their initial contexts of utterance, imbuing them anew with a vitality that is lacking in the more sterile environment of the *divan*. Autobiographical understanding of poetry was such a fundamental aspect of sixteenth-century Ottoman poetic culture that famous pieces by earlier poets, such as Ahmed Paşa, were retrospectively placed in apocryphal anecdotal contexts. *Tezkiire*s composed in the seventeenth century, however, point to a new poetic culture where such autobiographical and contextual understanding of poetry seems to have been replaced by a more “modern” attitude that views poetry as an aesthetic textual activity autonomous of real-life contexts. The first part of my paper will be devoted to the demonstration of this transition and the concomitant divorce between biographical and poetic/aesthetic discourses that had mutually informed each other through the sixteenth century. The second, and admittedly more speculative, part will attempt to make sense of this transition with reference to social history, in particular to changes in the make-up of the Ottoman elite in the wake of the so-called “late sixteenth-century crisis”. I will ask whether this transition might be part and parcel of a more general withdrawal of emotions and the personal from the space of writing, newly constituted as a public space as distinct from the private – a distinction that, I argue, does not apply to the earlier period. The relatively small, ideologically homogenous and adequately remunerated elite of the sixteenth-century was confident enough to colonize the space of writing as a secure, protected garden, as an intimate *meclis* setting, so to speak. The factionalist and fiercely rivalrous elites of the seventeenth century, on the other hand, paradoxically gave vent to their threatened subjectivities by silencing the personal in writing and withholding the emotional from a now-dangerous “outside world”. This new anxiety not only had a direct impact on *tezkiire* writing that was becoming markedly more impersonal and career-centric, emphasizing relations with grandees (as versus the older style that was equally concerned with personality and temperament, love life and relations with friends) but also undermined the older autobiographical understanding of poetry.

Cognitive Patterns in Greek Poetic Metaphors of Emotion: A Diachronic Approach

Poetic imagery systematically integrates archetypical emotion scenes with schematic narratives grounded on spatial cognition. To model these recurrent imaginative patterns, I use generic structures of conceptual integration (Fauconnier & Turner 2002), exposing conceptual templates recurrent across different periods of Greek poetry. These patterns recruit *image schemas* (Johnson 1987), that is, condensed redescriptions of perceptual experience, to construct imaginary narratives (Turner 1996) that blend basic spatial events with emotional meaning. Image schemas lie at the basis of the human conceptual system, as shown by developmental research on cognition in the first months of life (Mandler 2004). These generic integration networks underlie a wide variety of poetic metaphors. For example, an erotic emission coming from the body or from a superior force (as in the arrows of love, or a light or scent from the beloved) has been repeatedly used to conceptualize love causation in literature, everyday language, or rituals, from Antiquity to the twentieth century (Pagán Cánovas 2009).

To analyze these emotion discourses, or *emotives* (Reddy 2001), we need both a historical and a cognitive perspective (Reddy 2009). Studies of the language of emotions (e.g. Kövecses 1986, 2000) often incur in Anglocentrism (Wierzbicka 2009a-b) and neglect cultural diachrony in their search for universal patterns (Geeraerts & Grondelaers 1995, Geeraerts & Gevaert 2008). In order to avoid both flaws, this paper introduces a more complex cognitive model studying productive recipes of poetic creativity, and explores the wide diachrony of Greek poetry, with an emphasis on ancient and medieval texts. Since Greek culture has been at a geographical and historical crossroad for three millennia, the study is enriched through comparison with literary traditions from East and West.

Crucially, the instantiation of these conceptual templates varies significantly across individuals, communities and contexts, thus providing significant data about the history of emotion concepts. These conceptual blends of emotional and spatial meanings have a history, which sometimes can be traced back to the conceptual materials and cultural settings from which they arose (Pagán Cánovas, forthcoming). By using Blending Theory's dynamic model for meaning construction, the history of emotions can take an important step towards becoming a cognitive social science (Turner 2001, Eddy 2009).

References

- Fauconnier, G. & Turner, M. 2002. *The Way We Think: Conceptual Blending and the Mind's Hidden Complexities*. New York: Perseus Books.
- Geeraerts, D. & Gevaert, C. 2008. Hearts and (Angry) Minds in Old English. F. Sharifian, R. Dirven, N. Yu & S. Niemeier (eds.), *Culture and Language: Looking for the Mind inside the Body*. Berlin/New York: Mouton de Gruyter. 319-347.
- Geeraerts, D. & Grondelaers, S. 1995. Looking back at Anger: Cultural Traditions and Metaphorical Patterns. J. Taylor & R. E. MacLaury (eds.), *Language and the Construal of the World*. Berlin/New York: Mouton de Gruyter. 153-180.
- Kövecses, Z. 1986. *Metaphors of Anger, Pride, and Love: A Lexical Approach to the Structure of Concepts*. Amsterdam & Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Kövecses, Z. 2000. *Metaphor and Emotion: Language, Culture and Body in Human Feeling*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Mandler, J. 2004. *The Foundations of Mind: Origins of Conceptual Thought*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Pagán Cánovas, C. 2009. Erotic Emissions in Greek Poetry: A Common Link between Generalized Integration Networks. *Cognitive Semiotics* 6.
- Pagán Cánovas, C. Forthcoming. The Genesis of the Arrows of Love: Diachronic Conceptual Integration in Greek Mythology.
- Reddy, W. M. 2001. *The Navigation of Feeling: A Framework for the History of Emotions*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Reddy, W. M. 2009. Historical Research on the Self and Emotions. *Emotion Review* 1:4. 302-315.
- Turner, M. 1996. *The Literary Mind*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Turner, M. 2001. *Cognitive Dimensions of Social Science*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Wierzbicka, A. 2009a. Language and Metalanguage: Key Issues in Emotion Research. *Emotion Review* 1:1. 3-14.
- Wierzbicka, A. 2009b. Overcoming Anglocentrism in Emotion Research. *Emotion Review* 1:1. 21-23.

WELLSPRINGS & SEDIMENTS

Slobodan Dan Paich, Director & Principal Researcher, Artship Foundation, San Francisco

Reflections on Traditional, Popular and Early Music : An Approach to the Cultural History of Emotions

We propose an introductory discourse, with inter-disciplinary comparisons and open questions, into *music*, as one of the rich sources to investigate the cultural history of emotions.

To begin, we address Persian musical influences reaching as far as medieval Spain, followed by Arabic-Andalusian music influencing Ottoman classical and popular music. Selected and comparative examples are taken from the diverse geographic areas of the Caucasus, Anatolia, Bosphorus and Balkans on one hand, and the Middle East, North Africa and Iberian Peninsula on the other. Some common themes and ways of dealing, expressing and sharing emotions, are addressed by observing differences and similarities of musical forms, instruments, and documentary, non-verbal material from ethnographic and folkloric collections. All examples are presented as part of the history of ideas—as social and societal manifestations—exploring ideas of cultural continuity and adaptation. Technical, musical and musicological issues are addressed only to illuminate the central narrative of Traditional, Popular and Early Music as way of thinking about the Cultural History of Emotions. To *focus and contextualize* the discussion, the life work of three well-documented historic figures are chosen to probe into the tensions between *accepted norms* and *personal feelings*. As with most recorded cultural histories, the History of Emotions is relatively poor in representing and documenting the work and lives of women, especially musicians. Wherever possible and critically credible, we include documentary and anecdotal evidence, and open questions about women in the context created by the three examples:

Education of Feelings - Ibn Hazm (994-1064), Iberian proto-troubadour, who wrote primarily about law and theology, is also the author of *The Ring of the Dove*, treatises about love composed in the Arabic-Persian mode of *elegant writing*. Translator A.J. Arberry describes Ibn Hazm's work as a systematic treatment of love and affection, combining metaphysics, social commentary and psychology. In his introduction Arberry writes: "...[Ibn Hazm] enjoyed a happy though secluded childhood, and the advantages of an excellent education; he [Ibn Hazm] tells us that most of his early teachers were women."

Social Mores and Personal Emotions - Abu l-Hasan 'Ali Ibn Nafi' (789 – unknown) was nicknamed Ziryab. He was active at the Umayyad court of Córdoba in Islamic Iberia. He first excelled at the Abbasid court in his native Baghdad, as a performer and student of the great musician and composer, Ishaq al-Mawsili. Ziryab, who was of Persian, Kurdish or East African origin. He was knowledgeable and renowned in many subjects. As a poet, musician and singer, he brought a large number of innovations to the field. As a fashion designer, culinary reformer, crop introducer and strategist, he affected the sense of identity and emotional expressions and gender discourse. Ziryab's reforms and influences on everyday life may give a glimpse in to the mores of certain aspects of the cultural history of emotions of his time.

Complex Fertility of Diasporas: Dimitrie Cantemir (1673-1723), born in Moldavia, was one of leading intellectuals of Eastern Europe, a scholar, orientalist, composer, theorist, historian, polyglot and briefly Prince of Moldavia. Early on he was sent to the Ottoman Court in Istanbul as a *gilded hostage*. There he became a virtuoso player of tambour, a long-necked lute. He was in the inner circle of foreigners attending the Sultans. In 1710 he published "The Book of the Science of Music" including the Sephardic and Armenian musical traditions present and extremely influential in the formation of the theory and practice of 17th century Ottoman Classical Music. This music's cadences, musical structure and emotional underpinnings have become ubiquitous in the everyday lives of the Ottoman World and neighboring lands. The richness and overlay of verity in the *music diasporas* may help us look at complexity of the cultural history of emotions and the social and intimate discourses of the pre-modern world.

In closing, we reflect on the tentativeness, interpretive qualities and dangers in looking at the Cultural History of Emotions, and ask questions about the methodologies of looking into intangible heritages, oral traditions and music as starting points of the systematic enquiry into the field of emotions.

Tilmann Walter

Communicating Emotions in Premodern Scholars' Letters

Numerous libraries and archives in Germany and beyond have preserved letters of early modern physicians and other scholars. They are of great value to historical research in general and the history of medicine and science in particular. In the project “Early modern physicians' letters”, which is started in 2009 under the auspices of Bavarian Academy of the Sciences, the letters from and to physicians and other scholars, written between 1500 and 1700 in the German speaking area, which have survived in numerous institutions all over the world, will for the first time be systematically assessed and registered in a database.

Letters are usually considered as “Ego-documents” which allow an especially close insight into personal experiences such as emotions because they were consciously aimed at intersubjective communication. However, there are good reasons to be cautious about such a statement: the Western tradition of humanist letter writing generated a constant tension between authentic subjectivity and conventional writing practices. For example “amor” (love) was one of the most commonly used words to describe the existing or desired relation of the author and the recipient but it obviously denoted – in most cases – nothing but a superficial acquaintance. So it became, in the course of time, itself a convention to stress that the special relationship and “love” between writer and reader was *not only* conventional.

My paper will aim at examining the function of emotions in early modern scholars' letters: The expression of emotions was at first hand used to give the impression of real personal concern and to appeal to the addressee more insistently. Even official application letters were worded in a rather personal style: When, for example, the medical scholar Joseph Keller applied in 1599 for a professorship in Tübingen he primarily called upon the benevolence of the university officials – as Keller explained, he was not able to feed his wife and his children in his hometown Donauwörth and had, because of that, no more hope except the University would kindly appoint him as an unknown scholar.

Based on a comprehensive source material one might discuss how “true” these feeling were. For instance there are elaborated references to personal illness or the death of close relatives causing depression or grief. On the other hand, even reference to somatic phenomena like tears or insomnia could be conventional again: Especially insomnia was part of the role model of an early modern scholar who was expected to write his books in the middle of the night. So it was most promising if a letter writer could put particular stress on verifiable common experiences – such as common childhood memories and assistance received or given – with the recipient.

Dr. phil. Tilmann Walter
Akademieprojekt „Frühneuzeitliche Ärztekorrespondenzen“
Universität Würzburg
Institut für Geschichte der Medizin
Röntgenring 10
97070 Würzburg
tilmann.walter@web.de

Curriculum Vitae

- as of 1/2009 Full-time researcher in the long-time-project “Early modern physicians’ letters”, sponsored by the Bayerische Akademie der Wissenschaften, at the Institute for the History of Medicine at the University of Würzburg
- 11/2005– Full-time researcher at the Institute for the History of
11/2007 Medicine at the University of Würzburg in the DFG-funded project
“Early modern physicians’ authority”
- 10/2002– Full-time researcher at the Institute for the History of Medicine
11/2003 at the University of Heidelberg in the DFG-funded research-program
“History of the ‘Notgemeinschaft’ / DFG, 1920–70”
- 01/1999– Research assistant at the DFG-Sonderforschungsbereich 511
12/2001 “Literature and Anthropology” at the University of Konstanz
- 12/1997 Ph.D. at the University of Heidelberg under Prof. Dr. Oskar Reichmann
12/1993 with a dissertation on “Unkeuschheit und Werk der Liebe. Diskurse über
Sexualität zu Beginn der Neuzeit in Deutschland”
- 10/1988– Studies in History and German Literature and Linguistics
11/1993 at the University of Heidelberg

Edited Books

Tilman Walter: Die medizinische Republik. Ärzte in der frühen Neuzeit zwischen Bürgerlichkeit, Politik und Religion (in process).

Bernhard Kleeberg / Tilman Walter / Fabio Crivellari (eds.): Urmensch und Wissenschaften. Eine Bestandsaufnahme, Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 2005.

Claudia Bruns / Tilman Walter (eds.): Von Lust und Schmerz. Eine historische Anthropologie der Sexualität, Köln / Weimar / Wien: Böhlau, 2004.

Bernhard Kleeberg et al. (eds.): Die List der Gene. Strategeme eines neuen Menschen (Literatur und Anthropologie, Bd. 11), Tübingen: Narr (as coeditor), 2001.

Tilman Walter: Unkeuschheit und Werk der Liebe. Diskurse über Sexualität am Beginn der Neuzeit in Deutschland (Studia Linguistica Germanica, Bd. 48), Berlin / New York: deGruyter, 1998.

Selected articles

Tilman Walter: Eine Reise ins (Un-)Bekannte. Grenzüräume des Wissens bei Leonhard Rauwolf (1535?–1596), in: N.T.M. Zeitschrift für Geschichte der Wissenschaften, Technik und Medizin 17 (2009), p. 359-385.

Tilman Walter: Ärztehaushalte im 16. Jahrhundert. Einkünfte, Status und Praktiken der Repräsentation, in: Medizin, Gesellschaft und Geschichte 27 (2008), p. 31-73.

Tilman Walter: Begrenzung und Entgrenzung. Zur Genealogie wissenschaftlicher Debatten über Sexualität, in: Claudia Bruns / Tilman Walter (Hg.): Von Lust und Schmerz. Eine Historische Anthropologie der Sexualität, Köln / Weimar / Wien: Böhlau, 2004, p. 129-174.

Bernhard Kleeberg / Tilman Walter: Der mehrdimensionale Mensch. Zum Verhältnis von Biologie und kultureller Entwicklung, in: Bernhard Kleeberg et al. (Hg.): Die List der Gene. Strategeme eines neuen Menschen (Literatur und Anthropologie, Bd. 11), Tübingen: Narr, 2001, p. 21-67.

Tilman Walter: Konjunkturen und mögliche Folgen einer „Einheit des Wissens“, anlässlich von Edward O. Wilsons gleichnamigem Buch, in: Bernhard Kleeberg u.a. (eds.): Die List der Gene. Strategeme eines neuen Menschen (Literatur und Anthropologie, Bd. 11), Tübingen: Narr, 2001, p. 235-251.

Tilman Walter: Medikalisierung, Körperlichkeit und Emotionen. Prolegomena zu einer neuen Geschichte des Körpers“, in: Journal für Psychologie 8 (2000), p. 25-49.

Tilman Walter: Plädoyer für die Abschaffung des Orgasmus. Lust und Sprache am Beginn der Neuzeit, in: Zeitschrift für Sexualforschung 12 (1999), p. 25-49.

16. The Cultural History of Emotions in Pre-modernity II

Emotions East and West

İstanbul, Sept. 29-Oct. 01, 2011

Carin Franzén

Linköping University

Eastern Passion and Western Love

In his classical but rather dated study *Love in the Western World* from 1939 Denis de Rougement points out that there are parallels between the courtly love lyric of the troubadours and Arab mystic and erotic poetry, especially regarding the image of the Lady as “the spiritual and angelical part of man – his true self”, a trait he also defines as “the narcissism of passion”. He also detects this trait in medieval romances where the heroes are said not to love one another but love itself. To this conception of passion Rougement opposes a “western attitude” that he describes as fundamentally Christian, which rejects the passivity of passion by making love an act and marriage a sacrament. Rougement argues that passion did not spread in western history and culture earlier than the twelfth and thirteenth centuries thanks to the courtly love lyric in the Southern France, which in its turn “reached us out of the Near East and Persia”. According to Rougement, “passionate love, pagan [i.e. not Christian] love [...] spread through the European world the poison of an idealistic *askesis*”. In my paper I want to discuss these highly Eurocentric opinions on passion and the origins of courtly love from two different angles. First I want to compare Rougement’s judgements of courtly love with contemporary philological research on the Arabic influence on this tradition taking as point of departure Álvaro Galmés de Fuentes’ book *El amor cortés en la lírica árabe y en la lírica provenzal* from 1996. Secondly I will assess Rougement’s analysis of the contradiction between marriage and passion in the western cultural history from a gender perspective where it can be shown that “the poison of an idealistic *askesis*” were used as a strategy by pre-modern women writers in order to create a subject position in a male hegemonic order.

Abstract for the Conference The cultural history of emotions in pre-modernity

Love between religions in medieval Spain

The author intends to treat the notion of love, as found in three disputes held in the 12th and 13th century in what is today Spain. The notion will be contextualized by the philosophical tradition found in the crossroads of Al-Andaluz and the Christian reign Aragón during the eleventh, twelfth and thirteenth century, focusing on its use as a ground for inter-religious dialogue.

The idea of love connected to knowledge can be traced back to at least Plato, but it is interesting to see how the real and fictitious dialogues published between the 11th and the 13th century in Al-Andaluz and Aragón belong to a mutual development of the platonic concepts of love into a notion that can be seen as over bridging religious differences. Based on its connection to wisdom, being sincere and moving principles the notion of love becomes one of the universal principles with which medieval writers, such as for examples Ramón Llull, tries to synthesize the three religions.

Several studies have during recent years focused on the concept of love in later medieval writers such as Teresa de Ávila and San Juan de la Cruz, either understanding the concept as an intellectual one – connecting it mainly to a process of knowledge seeking – or as an emotional, often erotic, one – mainly in gender studies. This paper will instead focus on earlier medieval texts, all of them produced in a somewhat different context than the later Christian monastic life that was the background to the writings of both Ávila and de la Cruz, and that show a somewhat different use of the notion.

The differences in the political and cultural conditions at the time of writing (or in some cases talking) can be considered a prominent reason for the differences in the use of the notion of love. A Christian state not yet consolidated and a Muslim empire, that at least culturally still held large parts of the Mediterranean, and which also happened to be the haven of many of the Jews expelled from or persecuted in Christian Europe. The dialogues that will be the point of departure of the paper are held in Ceuta in 1176, between the Muslim Abutalib de Ceuta and the Jew Samuel de Toledo; in Barcelona in 1263, between the Jewish philosopher Maimonides and Pablo Christiani, a Jew converted to Christianity. The last one was held on the isle of Mallorca in 1286, between the Christian market salesman Igneto and different representatives of the Jewish faith.

All three dialogues treat the differences between the religions and try, in the style of Socrates, to come to terms with what should be considered as true faith. Although the dialogues openly profess difference they also rest on certain similar concepts and understandings, on which the possibility of the discussion rest. Such is for example the notion of love. Even though, in the dialogues, love is connected to knowledge and sometimes seen as a way to reach God, it is also the root of a legitimizing discourse by which the opponent is allowed his own religious beliefs, however erroneous they might be. It is this papers intention to further investigate a discourse around the concept of love as one of the ideological grounds for inter-religious

exchange in early medieval Spain, focusing on its communal rather than epistemological or individually emotional sides.

By Karolina Enquist Källgren
PhD-student
Gothenburg University

18. Emotions East and West - The Cultural History of Emotions in Pre-Modernity II
29.9.-1.10.2011, Istanbul

Abstract

Hanna Kietäväinen-Sirén, MA, doctoral student

Department of History and Ethnology, University of Jyväskylä, Finland

Providence, Enchantment or Warmth of Heart?

The Images of Love in Late 17th Century Finnish Countryside

During the last couple of decades, there has been an increasing interest in the study of marital life and love in early modern times. However, these studies have focused mainly on family history and utilised sources produced by upper classes of society. Thus, the emotional life of early modern people still remains to be discovered.

In Finland, there exists a well-preserved source material that touches immediately on the everyday life of the people: the district court records. In this paper, I shall use this material as a basis for an examination of the meanings and images or metaphors of love, both outside and in marriage. Following questions are to be answered: what kind of meanings people attached to emotion called love? How and in which circumstances was love expressed, with which words, actions, and gestures? How people recognised love, i.e. how a person in love acted? What was the origin of love? As an aid for the analysis I shall use at least three central theories on emotions: those of Catherine Lutz's, Peter and Carol Stearns' and Barbara Rosenwein's.

Love played a significant role in the emotional lives of the late 17th century Finnish people. Love had different meanings: the Lutheran church emphasized proper conduct towards one's spouse, patience and staying together despite hardships, but also sexuality. Popular discourse diversifies this image with material care, intimacy, tenderness and burning desire. Love was shown, of course, privately but also in public, with loving words, amiable conduct, gifts, kisses and embraces. What is striking is the linkage between marriage and love: the marital relationship was used as a metaphor of love even in extramarital affairs. However, the attitude towards love in late 17th century Finnish countryside was ambivalent: its origin could be described as God's providence, but also as captivating witchcraft.

19. The rhetoric of love: emotional markers in aristocratic letters of proposal in 18th century Sweden.

Brita Planck brita.planck@history.gu.se

PhD candidate Gothenburg University

Some time during premodernity marriage based on mutual love and affection became the norm and the only cultural acceptable reason for marriage. The origin of this revolution is often attributed to the new middleclass, while the aristocracy is presumed to have continued a more pragmatic marriage pattern.

When this change occurred is debated, and often depending on how the study is conducted. A quantitative study, based on statistical material, will show a very consistent marriage pattern, which often leads to the conclusion of a prolonged pragmatism. Hermeneutic studies, however, often show that love and affection was highly valued.

So how did this love manifest it self? One way to find out is to read letters of proposals, and study what kind of persuasion the suitor used. What kind of rhetoric did he use to the subject of the proposal? How did he convince the subject's father that he was an honourable man? How did she answer? And how did the father (or parents) answer? Is it possible to say something about what was considered most important in marriage alliances among the Swedish nobility from these letters?

Apart from the strict linguistic analysis these letters also reveal an evident gender inequality considering emotions. Love is apparently a male project, quiet contrary from modern times, where increasing intimacy and domesticity made love a female project.

Sufi Concept of Love: Reception and Interpretation in 18th Century South Asia

Love is an integral component of Sufism. The examination of the early Sufi texts on love (11th-14th Century) focus on the debate over the nature of love and the connection between worldly love and divine love. However, the examination of the classical texts is not from the perspective of the history of emotions, which views emotions and their expressions as shaped by the society in which they operate.

These texts, in course of time, travelled from the Arab and Persian world to South Asia where they were discussed in the Sufi hospices and often included in the curricula of the *madrasahs* (schools). The paper will examine the reception and interpretation of the concept of love by Indian Sufi Ulama (scholars) during the transition period from the erstwhile Mughal empire to the colonial rule. During this period, Muslim scholars and Sufis, with emphasis on their own role as sources of *irshad and ta'lim* (guidance) for the Muslims, felt themselves to be leaders of the Muslim community in the wake of the disintegration of the political structure. They became increasingly conscious of the necessity of a moral rejuvenation of the Muslim community in order to off-set the debilitating effects of 'general decline'. However, they had to struggle along with contending conceptions which they held before, and turn to the institutions and texts which were familiar to them while they no doubt modified their ideas and views which can be seen to be an adaptation to changed circumstances. This resulted in contestation over key concepts including the Sufi concept of love. The 'reformists' reinterpreted the key concept of love and criticized some mystical practices associated with this concept. This critique was opposed by the 'counter-reformists'. The debate is reflected in the various definitions of love and the treatment of profane and divine love in the writings of Indian scholars.

Rooted in the theory and practice of the history of emotions, the paper will situate the debate in the temporal and spatial context and will address the following questions: How did Indian Sufi scholars engage with the classical Sufi texts on love? How love was defined and conceptualized by the Indian Sufis? What norms and practices were prescribed to cultivate or control love? How far the interpretation of love was influenced by socio-political conditions and contemporary literary conventions? Was there an interaction with the non-Muslim concepts of love?

The examination the concept of love in the classical Sufi texts and in the writings of Indian Sufis in the 18th century helps us understand the Sufi concept of emotions in the pre-modern period and provides a fresh insight in exploring the cultural and political aspects of the religious discourses in 18th century India.

(Institutional Affiliation: Md. Sajjad Alam Rizvi, PhD. Candidate, Centre for the History of Emotions, Max Planck Institute for Human Development, Berlin, Germany)
Email: sajjad@mpib-berlin.mpg.de

21. Cultural History of Emotions in Pre-Modernity II

*İşıl Uçman Altınışık, İstanbul Bahçeşehir University

**Murat Burak Altınışık, İstanbul Bahçeşehir University

CLOCKS, HOROLOGY AND CELESTIAL FIGURES

IN THE PRE-MODERN OTTOMAN IMAGINATION

In the course of the 15th century, technological devices became progressively more cultural and social tools within the new contexts of urbanization and public space. The technical treatises and images aroused distinctly in this climate. Machines, arts/crafts and artisans/craftsmen became essential figures in these media. Considering the scape, Ottoman lands present a unique projection and, “clocks, horology and celestial figures” as the subject of this paper.

This paper does not offer a historical overview of the emergence of “celestial figures” in the pre-modern Ottoman context; nor the constitution of “horology”; rather, it offers to work on / to frame the Ottoman representation of the celestial figures as moral thus emotional elements in horological and technological developments between the late 16th century and the 18th century. In that sense, the images and the texts related with / concerning the issue and the context are the primary sources of this paper. Accordingly, this paper intends to view together the texts contemporary to the developments and read the pictures in the miniatures related with the issue.

Besides, this paper aims to display the involvement of the Ottoman administration, and thus the recognition and participation in the increasing significance of technology as well as the rising celebration of technological devices in the late pre-modern ideological, epistemological and moral landscapes, all of which are actually motivated by the technological determinism via technological progress and consecration. Distinctly, it is possible to follow this involvement since the period of Mehmet II and his instigation for artisans/craftsmen in general and clockmakers in particular coming and working in İstanbul. After Mehmet II, Süleyman I, the magnificent, was the exceptionally curious collector of precious *objects d’art* from all over the world. (Kurz, 1975, s.23) On the other hand, the period of Murat III, and the establishment of İstanbul Observatory by Takiyüddin in 1577, is important for the display of the Ottoman participation and celebration, and will be the focal point of this paper to frame the subject.

Consequently, this paper will try to display the pre-modern motivation of “technological consecration as an emotional value” within the late pre-modern Ottoman context by working on “the clocks, horology and celestial figures” through the contemporary media.

22.

Emotions East and West in Medieval China

E. N. Anderson

Dept. of Anthropology

University of California, Riverside

The standard Orientalist image of the collectivist East and individualist West is seriously challenged by evidence of massive exchange of ideas, philosophies, and rhetorics in the medieval period. Dr. Paul Buell and I have been working on a medieval encyclopedia of western medicine, the *Huihui Yaofang* from the early Ming Dynasty (see his companion paper for this conference). It introduced to China a great deal of knowledge on dealing with mental problems, including emotional trauma, but China was already aware of much of this knowledge, and had been accommodating Chinese and western medicine for centuries. Meanwhile, Chinese philosophy of emotion had been influenced increasingly by Buddhism and ultimately by western philosophy and psychology in general. My ethnographic research on Chinese emotion and culture half a century ago may help put this in perspective; China and the west are different, but not inordinately so, and their contact over millennia may have something to do with this. While my field research with Chinese fisherfolk was carried out long after the medieval period, it was done among highly traditional people, and literary evidence suggests considerable continuity; among other things, even the least educated fisherfolk were fully aware of and participant in the Confucian-Mencian moral universe (complete with Daoist and Buddhist influences), with all its programs for emotional management. Yet the fisherfolk were highly individualistic and placed a high value on being a distinctive, independent person. This sort of individual-in-society view runs through all Chinese history, and may be usefully analyzed with reference to continual contact with the west as well as with a strong history of indigenous independence in emotional life and emotional responses.

Emotions in a 15th Century Chinese Encyclopedia of Arabic Medicine (Abstract)

Paul D. Buell, PhD

Charité Medical University, Berlin

The present paper will focus on all material connected with emotions, terminology in particular, both Arabo-Persian and Chinese, in the *Huihui yaofang* 回回藥方, “Muslim Medicinal Recipes,” the fragments (15%, 500 large manuscript pages) of a great compendium of Arabic medicine as present in China in this version of the text from *circa* 1398 to 1408. The *Huihui yaofang* is of particular interest not only because of the purely Arabic medicine that it has preserved, complete with references to Galen and Arabic script entries for medicinals, terms, and medical authorities, including Galen himself, along with other important Arabic and Greek doctors and theorists, but because the text shows an on-going assimilation not just to Chinese medicine, but also, surprisingly, to what are apparently Tibetan and Indian traditions. This is something completely understandable since the *Huihui yaofang* originated in the Chinese Mongol era (1260-1368), as a text to support the practice of Arabic medicine in Mongol China, when it was the preferred form of elite medicine but also existed side-by-side with other forms of medicine, including Tibetan and, of course, Chinese.

The material connected with emotions is found primarily in discussions of specific categories of disease, e.g., generalized attacks by “wind,” including strokes, part of a large section in the surviving text. Such conditions, the text makes clear, can be caused by stressed emotions and specific mental illnesses, and many of the specific conditions involved are detailed by Arabic terminology, further explained in the commentaries accompanying disease descriptions. Material on emotions is also found in connection with specific recipes as something that this or that classic recipe, many of them attributed to the great doctors of the Medieval West, can cure. Although the present paper will focus on the *Huihui yaofang*, material from other Chinese sources of the time will be brought in for comparative purposes in part to test the hypothesis that there was non-Chinese influence on some of the thinkers of the so-called Song-Jin-Yuan 宋金元 school of thought then dominant in Chinese medicine.

24. Dr Eva Johanna Holmberg

Helsinki University/
Queen Mary, University of London

The 'Nature' and 'Character' of Ottoman Minorities in Early Modern English Travellers' Texts

My paper investigates the portrayal of the 'complexion' and 'nature' of peoples living under Ottoman rule in early modern English travel writings. Ideas about the disposition of eastern peoples were based both on ancient ideas about climates influencing the character of peoples and new ideas about emotions, dispositions and national character. I will consider particularly the ways in which encounters (and descriptions of them) of individual representatives of eastern peoples and the English both challenged and sometimes reinforced the claimed character differences between Western and Eastern peoples, whether Christian, Muslim or Jewish.

It has recently been argued by Mary Floyd-Wilson that 'ethnicity in the early modern period is defined more by emotional differences than by appearance: distinctions rest on how easily one is stirred or calmed – on one's degree of emotional vulnerability or resistance – or one's capacity to move others'.¹ The strength of Floyd-Wilson's argument ultimately depends on what one constitutes as 'bodily' and where the 'spiritual' begins. The general humoral constitution of an entire people, such as the Jews or the Turks, could be said to be good, even 'best'. This however did not preclude the possibility of criticizing a great variety of their other, inner or mental characteristics.²

A 'temperament' was determined in Galenic medicine by the proportions and combination of the qualities of hot and cold, dry and moist. These qualities together determined the 'nature' of plants, animals and humans.³ English travel writers and historians were not always consistent in their portrayals of the human spiritual constitution. Theories of human nature provided them with a framework, into which they tried to fit the various personalities they encountered, befriended or decided to be foes with during their travels in the East.

¹ Floyd-Wilson 2003, 133.

² Turks, for example, could simultaneously be seen as the most hospitable and most cruel people in the world. 'Mahomet' was often described as very intelligent but also avaricious and deceitful. Lithgow, *The Totall Discourse of the Rare Adventures* (1632), 161–162.

³ For humoral theory see Paster; Rowe & Floyd-Wilson 2004; Korhonen 2005a and 1999, 110–144; also Knuuttila 2004; for complexion and other major concepts describing human bodies and souls see Siraisi 1990, 97–106.

PD Dr. Angelika C. Messner
Chinese Studies/University of Kiel

Currently at:
Max Planck Institute for the History of Science
Berlin

Emotions and emotion-knowledge in Chinese History

Although we will never know, what and how people felt in the past, we can however investigate the ways people thought about emotions and related phenomena.

By taking this approach, my paper deals with the descriptions of emotions in 16th and 17th centuries' medical sources, in order to shed light on the material realities of emotions at the respective time and place.

As I shall argue, medical sources differ from literary sources in many ways: most importantly they were not mainly written in order to evoke the readers' emotions, but rather to represent the medical writers' ability in handling with disease and crisis, with the emotions in the centre of attention or as implicit/ explicit byproducts of ongoing bodily and social events.

A careful reading of these sources offers insights not only into the thought about emotions but simultaneously and essentially also into negotiations of experiencing and expressions of emotional processes, e.g. the every day life realities as well as extraordinary dimensions of emotions at the respective time and place. In doing so, we will come across a number of longstanding misconceptions in regard to emotions in the East (China), which we will discuss in terms of possibilities and limits of European and Eastern (Chinese) perspectives on the emotions.

In sum, my paper aims to explore the anthropological significance of the emotions in China in the period ca. 1500-1800, asking such questions as, How were emotions perceived and defined, how did these definitions structure everyday practice in relation to desire and conduct; How did every day life practices structure perception and definitions of emotions, How did definitions of emotions structure philosophical and esthetical discourses, How did everyday life practices structure regimes of body and self; what roles did emotions fulfill in the regimes of body and self? Answers to these questions can be used as first Steps towards an understanding of emotions and related phenomena „in their own terms“.

26. Emotions and the early modern body. Medical theories and lay experience.

Michael Stolberg, Würzburg

Recent work in the cultural anthropology and the history of emotions has convincingly demonstrated that emotions are to a very considerable degree culturally framed or indeed constructed. Love, hate, envy or fear, just to mention a few of the most common emotions, have been shown to be by no means anthropological invariables.

This paper will focus on medical theories and lay perceptions of the emotions in early modern Europe. At that time, it will claim, the “emotions” or “passions” were described and interpreted above all as bodily phenomena. Today, in Western culture, it is in an almost purely metaphorical sense that the emotions are located in the heart. Far into the 18th century, however, physicians and lay people alike regarded and experienced the emotions in a very literal, physical sense as “motions”, namely as movements of the humours, the spirits and the heart. In joy, for example, the spirits and the blood moved away from the heart towards the quite literally „attractive” outside object. The skin felt warm and the face blushed. In fear or sadness, on the other hand, the spirits and the blood withdrew from the unpleasant or abhorred object towards the heart, as evidenced by a sense of oppression and tightness around the chest.

This was not just abstract medical theory. Numerous private letters and dozens of autobiographies by early modern lay people bear witness to the degree to which this understanding also shaped the subjective – seemingly naturally given – experience of the emotions in ordinary life. When people wrote how they felt their heart “contracting” or trembling at a painful farewell they clearly described physical sensations, and it is telling that the German term “Angst”, which today translates as “fear”, was used, at the time, to describe a physical feeling of tightness and pressure around the heart, no matter whether someone was frightened or simply suffered from a bad cold or a “rheum” in the lungs.

Because of the predominantly physical, bodily nature of the emotions their impact on physical health was perceived as pervasive. In the case of strong emotions – i.e. a massive change of the natural movement of the heart, spirits and humours – it frequently appeared indeed as devastating. For this reason, emotions were given a much more prominent place also in the explanation and treatment of diseases, certainly among physicians but also among lay people who frequently attributed serious or indeed fatal diseases to specific emotional experiences which sometimes had occurred many years before.

27. Elena Bonesi

Phd student in History of Ideas,

Istituto di Scienze Umane (SUM), Firenze; Università di Bologna, Italy

ABSTRACT

A Proposal for Codification of the Iconography of Sorrow in Early Modern Western Europe (Giovanni Bonifacio)

In recent times a number of studies have been devoted to the classification of images of sorrow in the visual arts, but most of them, if not all of them, relate to the Medieval period. This consideration is quite curious, if we think how great a part the culture of sorrow has played in the Early Modern period, especially after the great events of the Reformation and the subsequent Council of Trent. That's why I decided to extend this kind of analysis to this latter period, focusing on the Counter-Reformation and the Italian area.

Despite narrowing the field of study, if we look at the production of images in the present context, we will be overwhelmed by a massive flow, which needs to be classified somehow. A first type of organization of all data could be a list of physical expressions.

In the seventeenth century, the debate on the nature of passions and their expression was intense and widespread, and it was accompanied by a parallel one on gestures. A common opinion was that gestures were the letters of a universal natural language that could be understood all over the world, independently from the nationality; here's how the conquerors of the New World could communicate with the native people, and how the mute could make themselves understood.

This was also the persuasion of Giovanni Bonifacio, a little known jurist from Treviso (in the North-East of Italy), who lived between the end of '500 and the first half of '600. In 1616 he published a treatise entitled *L'arte de' cenni* ("The Art of Gestures", or "Signs"), divided into two parts: in the first one, he provides a list of gestures, enumerated according the body parts they are related to, while in the second part, which is much shorter, he applies the knowledge of signs to the most diverse disciplines, such as Physics, Astrology, Geometry, Rhetoric, Economics, Politics, Medicine, Hunting and so on. The description of each gesture is associated with numerous citations, taken from the Bible, or the ancient authors, or from more recent ones. What I would like to do, is to bring together all the entries devoted to the expression of sorrow, or pain (I have collected about 70), and couple them with a corresponding picture from the same period, in order to see if there is a match between the written word and the painted, and to build a sort of vocabulary of sorrow for the Early Modern period.

A further step, which may start from an exchange of opinions with the audience, could be to verify whether everyone associates the emotion of sorrow with the same signs, to see if it's true that the language of gesture is universal, and also if it changes over time.

Of course, with this paper we do not propose responding to such big questions, but we only intend to arouse interest in the iconography of sorrow in Early Modern Italy (and Europe), and to begin to explore this field, which is largely unknown.

28. Ingrid Furniss, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor of Art
Lafayette College
205 Williams Center for the Arts
Easton, PA 18042
610-330-5866

Lutes and Loneliness:

Musical instruments as Cultural Metaphors for Emotion in Chinese art

Ingrid M. Furniss, Ph.D. (Lafayette College, Easton, PA)

Confucian ideology in pre-modern Chinese society emphasized the necessity of proper composure when coping with strong emotions, such as grief or anger. This ideal had a strong impact on how artists chose to express emotion as well. In figural painting, for example, they rarely used exaggerated facial expressions and movement to communicate emotion. Emotion was often conveyed through much more subtle visual cues that required an educated audience to understand them. Many of these visual cues were drawn from traditional texts, including the Confucian classics, poetry, and traditional songs.

Using Chinese paintings and inscriptions dating to the 10th to 15th centuries as evidence, my paper will show that musical instruments—especially lutes—were one such cue. Judging from a large amount of literary and visual data, the representation of musical instruments in paintings often directly or indirectly referenced familiar stories and the emotions that were associated with them. One of the most famous Chinese poems, *Pipa xing* (Song of the Lute) by Bai Juyi (772–846), for example, described a retired courtesan who had once been beautiful and highly desired by

men in the capitol. Now living in exile, she used her lute to convey her deep sadness and loneliness. Largely due to the longtime popularity of this poem among scholars, many of whom were also painters and poets, the lute became an oft-repeated cultural metaphor for grief, loneliness, and abandonment of courtesans and sometimes even the men who courted them.

Melancholy – Western and Ottoman Varieties

Melancholy, understood variously as temper, vice, emotion, ailment, or mental disposition of an individual or a society, has long since attracted the attention of scholars dealing with Early Modern cultures of Western Europe, their literature, religion, and art. The Western history of melancholy is multi-faceted: Since the 4th century AD “acedia”, that is: sadness, sloth, and remoteness of God, evolved as one of the deadly sins of Christianity; during the Renaissance melancholy was interpreted as a temper predisposing for intellectual and artistic professions: an ambivalent mental disposition which endangered the individual, but could in the same time enable them to achieve great things; and in the 18th century, particularly in the German territories, melancholy was considered to be the reaction of the bourgeoisie against its exclusion from political power.

In the Ottoman Empire, melancholy (*sevda*) became a “popular”, almost fashionable, emotion or ailment during the 17th and 18th centuries: Muslim preachers castigated it as a vice that induced people to forget their religious duties and led them off the straight path of Islam, and Ottoman doctors searched for explanations and remedies for this omnipresent illness: Dissatisfied with the knowledge they found in the traditional books of Islamic medicine, some of them turned to Western medical treatises and tried to understand *sevda* with their help.

My presentation will focus on the Ottoman interpretations and explanations of *sevda* and compare them with the Early Modern understanding of melancholy in Western Europe.

30. Sorrows we lived through:

A m/Othered reflection on humanity in a mythical context

Jun Luo

This paper is concerned with the depiction of sorrows in Chinese myths. It argues that myths are not there to be scrutinized, or to be commented on. They *reflect*. In other words, they embed their roots deeply in the substratum of human essence and recast it. They have their own voice. Although they are uttered through words, they have the ability to tell things that elude words, and once revealed, spurt, penetrating us. Or rather, they are absorbed by us. Myths, as this paper argues, lie in the middle between the passive and the active, between substratum and exterior; *i.e.*, they spread, stretch, and more importantly, *interpose*. This paper seeks to discuss this dynamic role of myths with special reference to one Chinese myth, *Lady Meng Jiang*, which is well known for its power in depicting an immense sorrow. In looking at sorrow in the context of myths, this paper does not only aim to crystallize the icy-cold reality that we – both the figures in myths and the figures in reality – face, and to evoke the image of the m/Other that we desire; but importantly, in doing so, it aims to yield a fruitful reading of the role of myths through the lens of ‘subjectile’ (Artaud 1999, Derrida 1998). As a result, it succeeds in avoiding scrutinizing myths *per se*, by *interposing* this analysis between two forces: the penetrating force that stems from the substratum and the smothering force that comes from the symbolically associated exterior.

Key words: myths, m/Other, interpose, subjectile

Dear Sir/Madam,

I am attaching my conference paper proposal abstract here, thanks very much for your interest in advance,

Best Regards,

31. Derya Gurses Tarbuck
Bahcesehir University
Faculty of Arts and Sciences
General Education Department
Çırağan Caddesi
34353 Beşiktaş / İSTANBUL
E-mail: deryagurses@hotmail.com

Paper Title:EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY MORAL PHILOSOPHY AND THE SECULARIZATION OF MELANCHOLIA

Abstract:Eighteenth-century philosophers of emotion increasingly regarded fear and pleasure as categories that were related to the body. By doing this they provided the grounds for the concept that Melancholia represented a change that was initiated in the body. This can be regarded as an escape from the metaphysical sphere on the philosophers' behalf in the eighteenth century. This shift also can be observed in the methods of diagnosing and curing Melancholia. The ways that the emotions are initiated and expressed in the body started to be evaluated using Lockean and Newtonian methods. Another shift that occurred during the eighteenth century is that the study of the mind came to be regarded as part of a study of moral philosophy rather than of religious ethics . This also gave birth to the idea that a treatment for melancholy should be related to the philosophy of the mind, thus giving birth to psychiatry. The aim of this paper is to elaborate these points of view within the general framework of the secularization of Melancholy, by examining treatises that dealt with the subject in the eighteenth century.

32. “Moaning caravan” and “weeping nightingale”: personal and collective *sorrow* in pre-modern Anatolian Alevi community.

This paper is aimed at considering how the emotion of *sorrow* was constructed by poetical means to shape/represent personal and collective experience of Alevi-Bektashi minority communities in Ottoman Empire. I am going to analyze verses composed, on the one hand, in the genre of “deyiş”, that is, lyrics reflecting individual spiritual experience of mystical love, and on the other hand, those done in the genre of “dûvazdeh Imam”, that is, spiritual hymns with recitation of twelve imams of the Shia tradition, where the central role is assigned to imam Ali. In my analysis I shall rely on the poems attributed to Shah Ismail Hatayi, the founder of Safavid state, whose poetry to a great extent shaped the confessional tradition of Anatolian Alevites, and to Pir Sultan Abdal, an Anatolian folk poet (aşık) of the 16th century.

As a starting point I take the first line of a deyiş by Pir Sultan Abdal: “Seher vakti kalkan kervan / “Inileyip zarilenir” (Caravan starting off at dawn/ Moans and groans). In efforts to unravel the meaning of the “moaning caravan” metaphor I shall address a scope of other poems by the same author, where the caravan metaphor is utilized. Among them are well-known “Geçti dost kervanı” (Friend led way the caravan) and “Onun katarından ayırma bizi”(Don’t separate us from His caravan). Being composed in the genre of “dûvazdeh imam”, the latter verse sheds light on the essence of the metaphor in Alevi-Bektashi poetical tradition, where it seems to signify “the Way” of spiritual growth, believed to be elaborated by prophet Muhammad and his brother-in-law Ali ibn abi Talib, with its stages being specified by and embodied in personalities of eleven imams of Shia tradition, prophet’s wife Fatima and Bektashi’s prominent saint Haci Bektash Veli. At the same time, the metaphor of the caravan serves to establish the idea of belonging to the family of prophet, in other words, the basic concept of “Ehl-i beyt”, constructing the identity of Alevi community. At the core of this construction dwells the idea of continuity of emotional and physical sufferings endured by the followers of Ali, exemplified in martyrdom of his son Huseyn, and shared by Anatolian Alevites oppressed by the Ottoman state and living in a hostile social environment. Thus, the emotion of sorrow becomes central for the collective self-awareness of the community. On the other hand, being involved in the tradition of Anatolian Sufism in its folk version, members of the community are supposed to have their own individual experience of “being on the Way”, where the emotional suffering is shaped by love to Friend, and where the emotion of sorrow is evoked by the state of separation with the Beloved. Here Alevi poets borrow common sufi metaphors of a nightingale and a rose. Building up vocabularies of emotions as a sort of clusters around the core emotion of sorrow, I attempt at counterposing and juxtaposing collective and personal modes of the emotion.

I shall argue that sorrow as a personal emotion, though cherished and evaluated as an indication of an individual’s spiritual growth and advancement on the Way, is nevertheless assessed by the community as an emotional suffering and is believed to be soothed by the awareness of

belonging to the community and to the tradition of collective suffering (caravan). Thereby, cruel Beloved is transformed into merciful Friend, and collective sorrow coexists with hope.

33. Swift and Bitterness

GÖNÜL BAKAY

Satire is one of the popular literary forms used in the 18th century. It was the form most often used by Swift. His satire was bitter. This paper aims to prove that by his bitter satire in his short essays: “A modest Proposal” “A Short View of the State of Ireland” and “On The Present Miserable State of Ireland”, Swift aimed to draw the reader’s attention to the unjust colonial policy of England.

Swift believed that although Ireland had a rich soil and excellent climate, England was using all its produce without leaving anything for Ireland’s use. Swift observed: “. How long we shall be able to continue the payment I am not in the least certain.: one thing I know , that when the hen is starved to death, there will be no more golden eggs.” (508)

Especially, Swift pitied the cottagers who were so desperate that they could not find money to pay for food and clothing for their children. In “A Modest Proposal”, his most bitter essay, Swift suggested that instead of many children dying from abortions and undernourishment, their flesh could be used for food. He suggested . “a young healthy child well nursed is at a year old a most delicious nourishing and wholesome food, whether stewed, roasted,baked or boiled ,and I make no doubt that it will equally serve in a fricasse or a ragout.” (509)

Bitterness is called an ugly and destructive emotion. Nature’s purpose for bitterness is defined as; “keep feeling something till we take some action to help remedy a socially unhealthy situation.” In case of Swift, I believe ,this destructive emotion has served for a good end by leading Swift, to produce his bitterest essays criticizing England’s colonial policy and hence enlightening the reader to the dire consequences of this policy.

The Title of the Subject	34. A COMPARATIVE STUDY: THE COLOURS AND THEIR MEANINGS IN MEDIVEAL ANATOLIAN ISLAMIC AND CHRISTIAN ARCHITECTURE.
The Name of the Author, Address, e-mail, Phone Number,	Hatice DEMİR Kastamonu Üniversitesi Kastamonu Meslek Yüksekokulu haticedemir99@hotmail.com 0 542 457 61 75
The Subject of the Study	In this study we are going to compare the importance and place of colours of Islamic architecture with the Christian one in Anatolia in middle age. The colours as an ornamentation element have been very important throughout the ages. The artists have tried to express their beliefs, thoughts and emotions with using colours in their works. Each colour has a symbolic meaning. In this study we will try to explain the language of the colours in mediveal Anatolian Architecture.
The Method of the Study,	In tihis study we are going to compare the Islamic constructuon samples with the Christian ones in Anatolia.
The Target of the Study,	We try to find out the common points of colour symbolism in two different cultures.
Key Words,	Islam, Christianity, Architecture, Middle Age, Colours, Symbols, Emotions.

35.

VIOLENCE AND FEAR IN AL-ANDALUS

Dr. Maribel Fierro

Research Professor

Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas (CSIC) / Higher Council for Scientific Research

Madrid – Spain

Previous research I have conducted on the treatment of violence in Andalusí sources - such as “Decapitation of Christians and Muslims in the Medieval Iberian Peninsula: narratives, images, contemporary perceptions”, *Comparative Literature Studies*, 45/ 2 (2008), 137-64 (volumen on *Al-Andalus and its Legacies*) – has led me to establish a (still provisional) repertoire of *topoi* of violence. Such *topoi* are closely linked to the representation of the emotions provoked in those who exercise the violence, those who suffer it and those who are witnesses. In my paper, I will explore the reaction of fear in situations of violence drawing from episodes of war and rebellion (from the eighth to the fifteenth century). What I am interested on this occasion is in the vocabulary used and the body gestures involved in descriptions of fear found in Andalusí (Arabic sources), with the aim of establishing a comparison with the material found in Christian sources from the same period.

36. Dr. Anu Korhonen
Department of World Cultures
University of Helsinki, Finland
anu.korhonen@helsinki.fi

Abstract for paper in *Emotions East and West*, CHEP 2011 conference in Istanbul

Does Laughter Express an Emotion? Views from 16- and 17th-Century England

Laughter can be happy, or it can be scornful. It can be an expression of intellectual wonder, or it can be a sign of lacking mental ability. How did sixteenth- and seventeenth-century writers envision the connections between laughter and emotion? What were the emotions that laughter was related to, and what was its place in the emotional schemes of the period?

Laughter itself is not a passion nor a perturbation, nor is it at all clear what emotions it might spring from. Yet whenever early modern theorists tried to explain what laughter was all about, they resorted to emotions and suggested different emotional states as its origin.

In this paper, I will discuss joy, delight, and mirth, easily counted as emotions in early modern thinking, as well as more complicated sentiments, such as feelings of superiority, modesty, and shame, and look at what kinds of laughter they produced. Laughter was often counted as an expression of astonishment and surprise, sometimes even of fear, and mixed feelings arising from a violation of what was expected, or of senses being deceived, could also burst out as laughter.

Was laughter, then, a bodily gesture that was solely meant for emotional expression, or was it something in its own right? Was it one among a range of possible expressions for certain emotional states, or was there perhaps an emotion that could be counted as its primary cause? Why was it such a complex task to capture the essence of laughter in the first place?

Early modern writers also looked at laughter as a bodily gesture that was linked both with the body's inner constitution and its outer discipline. Both had to do with emotions and their expression. Obviously, melancholics seldom laughed while the sanguine temperament was manifested in a merry outlook. But laughter could also work as therapy, balancing the humors and expelling excess fluids – how did the emotions engendering laughter figure in this? When different body types indicated different emotional frames, did humors also predispose different people to varying tendencies in their laughter?

My analysis centres on England, but the material will also include texts originally written in other Western languages, translated and adapted into English or widely read in England in the early modern period. Both expression of laughter and expression of emotion are highly culture-specific questions, as early modern writers well knew, but understanding emotions and laughter were also needed to appreciate what humans in different parts of the world shared – laughter was a *propre de l'homme*, part of the essence that joined all humankind and distinguished people from animals, or so the early moderns believed. My evidence comes from a variety of textual genres, from courtesy books, rhetorical treatises, and natural philosophy to letters, jest books, and other forms of popular literature.

37. The Theory of Carnival and the Ottoman Professional Dance
By María Dolores Tena Medialdea
University of Valencia (Spain)
lolatena@hotmail.com

This paper is a multidisciplinary approach from the Gender Studies perspective to the professional Ottoman dance where dancers' bodily image, dance features and audience perceptions are regarded as semiological signs. The category of gender prevails upon musical activities and, thus, kinesthetic vocabularies and dancing practices are configured under gender roles. The concepts of masculine and feminine, more than just cultural expressions, embrace psychic positioning of the individual subject that is materialized in the bodily representation, revealing as a symbolic form of the culture. Besides, dancing bodies convey beliefs and ideas about sexuality and sex roles since dance, as a social act and cultural expression, shares with sexuality the human body as instrument. Dance, understood as the art of expressing emotions through gesture and movement, reveals collective and historically specific constructions dealing with the unconscious processes of fantasy and desire. However, as a symbolic creation detached from daily life, dancing enables also displaying the counter-production of culture that operate as subversive strategies against the hegemonic homogeneity.

The Ottoman solo dance was traditionally organized in professional ensembles, *kols*, gender divided which performances embraced the global idea of *musikê*, branched out with the introduction of Modernity. Professional entertainers occupied a lower status within Muslim societies, either slaves or hired professional performers, since belonging to a marginal acknowledged profession; even so, they were also regarded as objects of beauty and desire. The correlation among sexism, racism and classicism shaped in dancing and constructed the edges of desire around professional entertainers, women, ethnic and social minorities. However, the solo improvised dance, more than being purposely seductive has been usually performed for its pleasure-giving value, the aesthetic quality of *tarab* that connects performer and audience in a reciprocal enjoyment. Traditionally, gender segregation in social events of Muslim communities has been overcome by transvestism that allowed satirizing social conventions on gender expectations within the pantomime dances. Likewise, formal and informal dances have intersected, since audience has customarily participated together with professional entertainers along the performance, before stage forms were introduced. These features allow regarding the solo dance in terms of a carnivalesque display, since transgresses the limits of what is inside and outside of the hegemonic culture, offering a dialogical perspective. Mikhail Bakhtin's concepts of carnivalesque and grotesque body review the pre-modern harmony that, rooted in folkloric sources, displayed the non-official language of the dominant culture, diminished to the domestic or private environments.

The cultural crossover generated during colonial European expansion overlapped with the last period of the Ottoman Empire, enhancing the Western cultural apparatus. In the complex colonial societies, Ottoman professional dance was transforming within cabaret venues about the turn of the 19th century. The emergence of these new leisure spaces was a worldwide phenomenon linked to the growth of urban centres and the development of the metropolitan and national identities as signs of modernity. Accordingly, the assumption of modern heterosexual standards fetishized female dancing bodies and shaped the exclusively feminine form of dance, namely Oriental dance.

38. Paper Proposal for the Conference: Emotions East and West – The Cultural History of Emotions in Pre-Modernity II

Passions and Emotions in the Greek-language Ethical Guides of the late 18th –mid 19th century

Merih Erol

(Center for the History of Emotions: Max-Planck Institute for Human Development, Berlin)

Abstract

Recent research has shown that in medieval Christian monastic communities, desires and feelings were reconstructed and cultivated through a discursive practice. To mention the philosophical tradition which generated and advised analogous practices in the previous epochs, one has to remember that both the pagan and the early Christian thought which reflected on categories such as impulses (*ormē*), desires (*epithumia*), appetites (*orexē*) and passions (*pathos*), acknowledged that virtue formation could be realized through disciplinary practices which attempt at producing, transforming, moderating or eradicating emotions. Drawing on the insights of the ancient philosophers on the one hand, and on the patristic tradition on the other, the late 18th century Orthodox devotional writings provided spiritual counsel to the lay Christians encouraging the cultivation of certain emotions and moral dispositions through various practices i.e. prayer, confession, fast and others.

In my paper, I will try to offer a reading, from the perspective of the history of emotions, of the normative literature written in Greek language in the period from the late 18th to mid-19th century, which dealt with the “fighting” against one’s passions/emotions. One of the basic assumptions of the paper is that emotions – their conceptualizations and their expressions - are historically variable and open to change.

The authors of the spiritual and ethical guides that will be analyzed were Orthodox monks, educational reformers and ethicists whose works were widely read among the Greek-speaking Orthodox populations within and outside the Ottoman Empire. The paper will present some preliminary hypotheses and results gathered from a small portion of the sources that I have been analyzing in the framework of a broader project which attempts at investigating the formation of the ‘ethical self’ in the literate Greek-speaking urban classes of the Ottoman Empire and the Greek state in the period ca. 1800 to 1922. Some of the issues which this paper will explore are the conceptualization of emotions, their location in the body, the components of the soul, the definition of the ‘will’ etc. These questions will be investigated in the works of Nikodimos of the Holy Mountain (1748-1809) on spiritual exercises and practices like confession, who himself was a contemporary of Voltaire and familiar with the work of Spinoza; the educational reformer Neophytos Vamvas (1770-1855); the Archimandrite Dionysios o Thettalos (d.1853) and the founder of the pietistic movement *Theosebism* with close connections to Protestantism and deism, Theophilos Kairis (1784-1853).

**“Governing the passions”: emotion-management in D.V. Coornhert’s
Zedekunst dat is wellevenskunste (1586)**

It is well-known that the theory of the human emotions forms a long philosophical tradition dating back to early Greek political philosophy - one of the first adumbrations (if not the very first) of a theory of the passions being Plato’s parable of the charioteer and his two horses. In general, not only the classical age but also the seventeenth century are put forward as two of the most decisive moments in the history of human affections. Carole Talon-Hugon for example, opens her study on human emotions by stating that “[s]i le XVIII^e siècle fut le siècle du sentiment, le XVII^e siècle fut celui des passions, les traités sur le sujet y sont innombrables”¹. Whereas it leads no doubt that classical thinkers such as Plato set out the beacons towards any further reflection on the matter, there is yet another historical context in which the reflection on human emotions has revealed itself to be of particular importance : the Renaissance.

In fact, although seventeenth century thinkers abundantly drew upon what was written in the previous century, scholars have often overlooked Renaissance writings in studying the history of theorisation on human emotion. This is also the case for Michel Foucault’s sparse notes on the early modern era. In fact, Foucault mentions the problematic of human emotions only sideways, and he does so in relation to Antiquity rather than to the early modern period. This is why the aim of my paper will be to confront Foucault’s (later) ethical thinking on identity formation - centred around the classical age – with that of an early modern moral treatise, namely the *Zedekunst dat is wellevenskunste* (1586), written by the Dutch philosopher D.V. Coornhert (1522-1590). This text is particularly interesting because of its governmental undertone, which undoubtedly contributed to Coornhert’s focus on the importance of human emotions and their good management. From this prospect, the early modern form of governmentality forms a beautiful example of the traditional connection - existing since Antiquity - between politics and the passions.

In my paper, I would like to take up the analysis of Coornhert’s ethical work to connect Foucault’s earlier, more politically orientated reflections on governmentality with his later thought on ethics (*Le Gouvernement de soi et des autres*, *Le Souci de soi*). I think this connection is relevant because the Renaissancist model of identity formation was largely based on that of Antiquity, the difference being that it became related to the pastoral need evoked by the religious disputes of that time and the particular demands of early modern politics. Secondly, I would like to use the comparison between Foucault and Coornhert to question the French (monarchist) context from which Foucault’s theory of governmentality originated, this in order to compare it with the Dutch early modern context.

¹ Carole Talon-Hugon, *Descartes ou les passions rêvées par la raison. Essai sur la théorie des passions de Descartes et de quelques-uns de ses contemporains*, Paris, Vrin (coll. Philologie et Mercure), 2002, 7.

40. Camilla Schjerning

Men of honor and women of passion: emotions, morality and gender in late 18th century Copenhagen

The proposed paper explores the relationship between gender, emotions and feelings of right and wrong in late 18th century Copenhagen (1771-1801). Through the looking glass of everyday conflicts, primarily as presented in connection with civil and police court cases, the paper traces patterns in the expression of moral emotions such as anger, contempt, shame and compassion in actions as well as words. Furthermore, it deals with how these patterns differed from one community within the city to the next, and how these differences played out in the negotiation of moral norms.

One of the main points of the paper is, that moral emotions - in words as well as in practice – both affect and reflect this ongoing negotiation of norms, and the struggles between different social communities within society to define what is right and wrong.

Morality, sentiments, virtues and civic duties were hot topics of the time, and even though an emotion such as compassion might commonly have been agreed upon as being good, the different communities within the city each had their own set of emotional norms and strategies for dealing with offences and moral violations. One important factor was of course the individual's position in the social hierarchy, but another factor that came into play was the question of gender.

The court material holds a large number of cases where women, many soldiers' and sailors' wives, are the instigators of verbal and physical skirmishes. Such unruly women were also well known motifs in satirical writings of the time - often portrayed as being in the grip of their passions, lacking all sense of shame, honor and morality. On the other hand, a sense of honor was something their men possessed - so much so that it oftentimes made their tempers flare out of control. Even though feelings and sensibility were by many seen as a necessary prerequisite for morals, these passionate displays of emotion often conflicted with ideals of the rational, ethic citizen and the virtuous, compassionate wife and mother.

From this vantage point of the ambiguous role of emotions in the shaping of morality and virtue, the paper attempts to shed light on the negotiations of moral norms in the late 18th century - arguing that emotions played a crucial role in everyday moral practice, regardless of social position or gender. The difference seemed more to be a matter of differing options and habits for dealing with and voicing feelings of violation, than a question of moral sensibilities; strategies that were shaped, among other things, by the gendered space of everyday life in the city.

41. “Forms Wondrous and Strange”:

Pity, Contempt, and the Grotesque in Evliya Çelebi’s *Book of Travels*

In the course of his wide-ranging travels both within and beyond the Ottoman Empire in the 17th century, Evliya Çelebi encountered numerous unusual phenomena, often described by him as “wondrous” (*‘acib*) and/or “strange” (*‘garib*). While many of these were such phenomena proper as magic and miracles, in several cases the “phenomena” in question were not events or objects, but people—particularly people with physical abnormalities of varying degrees—or strange customs. However, insofar as these particular “phenomena” were people, an admixture of description and emotion was, to a certain extent and especially considering that Evliya Çelebi was an author who tended to wear his opinions and emotions on his sleeve, inevitable.

In this paper, I will be exploring, firstly, how Evliya Çelebi employs elements of the grotesque in his depictions of the physically deformed and of those who he deems ugly, as well as in certain descriptions of customs that he finds outlandish: as an author virtually obsessed with the recording of even minute details, Evliya Çelebi was very liberal and exact in conveying to the reader whatever abnormalities he came across. Secondly, I will be looking at the particular emotions with which these depictions and descriptions are, or at least seem to be, inscribed. In the case of individuals, it will be shown that the dominant emotion stirred by such “grotesque” figures is pity, but that in certain of these cases Evliya Çelebi, as the narrator, is moved not to pity but to varying degrees of contempt for the object of his description. In the case of peoples and customs, it will be emphasized—following Robert Dankoff’s work in *An Ottoman Mentality: The World of Evliya Çelebi* (2004) and “*Ayıp değil!* (No Disgrace!)” (2008)—that, though the narrator Evliya Çelebi frequently seemed to feel a certain degree of contempt for peoples he found strange and customs he found outlandish, he was typically reticent about giving open expression to this emotion. Finally, I will be analyzing the different positions of these various individuals and customs in relation to the narrator Evliya Çelebi as a representative of the Ottoman Empire, in an attempt to tease out how their sociocultural, religious, or political status may have helped to shape the particular emotions that Evliya felt toward them, and what this may (or may not) tell us about the 17th-century Ottoman emotional palette.

Pity in Ancient Greece

The fifth-century BC writer Herodotus tells how the Persian king Xerxes, upon viewing his troops arrayed at the Hellespont, suddenly burst into tears. As the king explains, it has just occurred to him that not one of the men he is looking at will be alive a hundred years later, and so he pities (*katoikteirai*) the brevity of life.

This image of Xerxes at the Hellespont invites us to explore the ancient Greek concept of pity: the words that expressed it – *oiktos* and *eleos* – and the nature of the emotion. We ought to be wary of the invitation, for such an exploration will be fraught with difficulty. Can we proceed without wrongly mapping our own conceptual universe onto an alien culture? Anthropologists who study living people often struggle with this problem; for classicists, it is compounded by time. The ancient Greeks left behind mere fragments of evidence for pity, which was in any case a “fuzzy” concept. Can we even translate the Greek terms *oiktos* and *eleos* into English without stumbling?

Herodotus and subsequent Greek historians offer tantalizing insights into the folk psychology of pity because in recounting events they interpret human motives. So do orators like Demosthenes.

I start by following standard procedures for lexical analysis. My first goal is to establish the denotation or core meaning of the Greek terms. Like most words, *oiktos* and *eleos* are polysemic: that is to say, they possess multiple meanings and can denote more than one thing. Typically, both denote Person A’s feeling of sorrow or distress aroused by the misfortunes of Person B, who is in pain or jeopardy. Their reference to a feeling of sorrow rather than a dispassionate calculation seems obvious and indisputable when an ancient author classifies either *eleos* or *oiktos* with other emotions. Aristotle does this, and so does Demosthenes. The latter lists *eleos* among a myriad of emotions, including envy, anger, and a desire to please, that can lead Athenians astray (Dem. 19.228).

Having considered the meaning of *oiktos* and *eleos*, I next examine in greater detail the Greek folk psychology of pity: the sense perceptions that trigger the feelings, its relation to weeping and tears, and the locus of pity within the human body.

Ancient Greek intellectuals might have been surprised to learn that Paul Ekman, in his neo-Darwinian quest for ‘basic emotions,’ has nothing to say about pity. It perhaps lies hidden within his category ‘sadness.’ Other evolutionary biologists and psychologists, attempting to explain altruism, point to the fundamental importance of sympathetic responses within human society (remarked upon ever since Hume), yet few scholars today would argue that specific concepts such as pity and *eleos* or *oiktos* are universal rather than culturally constructed. Rather, their cultural specificity is what makes them interesting to us, especially as we try to understand the history of emotion.

Amal Ghazal

Speaking to God: Dreams, Sufism and the Pre-Modern in the Liberal Age

This paper analyzes the manifestation and meaning of emotions as they were expressed in the dreams of conservative Sufis who tried to shield Islam from 'modernity' and the 'modern' by conceiving and defending Islam in pre-modern Sufi hermeneutics. While the intellectual history of the late Ottoman Empire, including that of religious thought, has been largely defined by the movements of modernization and liberalism, this paper sheds light on an anti-modernist movement that defied this trend and opposed a modernist-reformist version of Islam. At the helm of this movement was the prolific Sufi Ottoman judge based in Beirut, Yusuf al-Nabhani, who considered a modernist version of Islam a threat to Muslim traditions and to the Ottoman Empire itself. Al-Nabhani recorded tens of dreams that document how conservatives clung to certain Islamic traditions rooted in the pre-modern period in order to resist and argue against a modernist Islam.

Muslims created a theology of dreams known as dream interpretation, also considered one discipline of the Sharia. According to Muslim traditions, true dreams can be a form of revelation and they function as a communicative tool between Muslims and either God or Prophet Muhammad. In particular, dreams occupied an important place in Sufi traditions whereby the metaphysical aspects of Sufism became diffused in Sufi dream narratives. Since symbolism is at the heart of dream interpretation, emotions expressed in dream literature determine much of that symbolism and how to interpret it. Thus, smiles, laughter, happiness, a glowing face, etc... provide a positive context for the dream while sadness, anger and a frowning person can indicate a negative meaning.

Towards the end of the nineteenth century, many Sufi practices and beliefs became under attack by Muslim reformers, especially those advocating a reform geared towards a modernist Islam. This Sufi/anti-Sufi battle became a hallmark of the intellectual and political life at the time, with modernist reformers accusing their conservative Sufi opponents of backwardness and of causing stagnation among Muslims, and conservatives accusing reformers of undermining Islam and its traditions and introducing a 'Protestant' version of the religion. Conservative Sufis resorted to dreams and dream interpretation to defend their position and make their case, something modernist-reformers refrained from doing and indeed criticized as superstitious and as irrational. By resorting to dreams, Sufis were drawing God and Muhammad directly on their side in their battle against modernist-reformers. As an evidence of divine support for conservatives and for their defense of Muslim traditions under attack and of divine condemnation of a modernist Islam, dreams were a theater for a display of emotions. Those emotions were those of God himself or of Prophet Muhammad, of the conservative Sufi dreamer, and of others involved in the debate between reformers and conservatives. Positive emotions such as a happy Prophet or a smiling God appearing in a dream were recorded to indicate that both God and Muhammad were pleased by the conservatives and by their efforts to defend the traditions of Islam. This display of emotions would always be related to an argument or a debate between conservatives and reformers occurring in the context of a dream. In cases where either God or the Prophet looked sad or mad or frowning, it indicated dissatisfaction with the reformers. Neither God nor the Prophet said much in the dream and thus, emotions functioned as a dialogue between the dreamer, God, and the Prophet. A positive emotion from either God or Muhammad would immediately solicit a similar one from the dreamer and a negative one would solicit anguish. Thus, the content of the dreams was as much about words as about emotions. In fact, emotions determined the meaning and the context of the words.

Relying on the dream as a site of emotions was an affirmation by the conservatives that the legitimacy of Islam was to be sought within the same traditions described by reformers as “pre-modern” and considered by them unfit with an Islam that should make the transition to the modern age. Thus, up until the early twentieth century, conservative Sufism was still clinging to and defending a world framed by pre-modernity.

Debating Jesus' tears: Christology in the spiritual writings of the northern humanists, 1500 – 1525

Paper Abstract

The presence of emotions in Jesus has generated some of the most perplexing problems in the history of Christianity. What did it mean for a supreme being to feel? Did Jesus take on only some emotions and not others? Could he possess emotions and still be free of sin? Were his tears genuine if he had already known how events would unfold? Only very recently have historians turned their eye to these theological problems, and moreover, much of the scholarship in this area has tended to focus on the medieval West. For instance, Rachel Fulton has shown that the image of a suffering God became the central motif in Christianity only at the turn of the first millennium. Earlier Christians had instead organized the aesthetics of their worship around a more triumphant figure, a fact that is often forgotten given the – in retrospect – obvious emotive power of a profoundly *human* God.

This paper takes up some of the same questions by focusing not so much on the medieval West but on the Christological debates that gripped northern humanists in the two decades surrounding the Reformation. Between 1500 and 1530, intellectuals such as Thomas More and Desiderius Erasmus offered their own interpretations of Christ's suffering; their spiritual tracts were penned amidst a background in which European societies were forced to deal with the outbreak of the Protestant reformations, as well as the looming presence of the Ottoman Empire. Through close readings of northern humanist spiritual writings during this important period, the paper examines two questions. In the first place, did early modern Christologies differ markedly from the interpretations made by medieval theologians? Why did humanists begin to engage in renewed debates about the emotions of Jesus? Second, how might these early modern writers have been sensitive to extra-European intellectual and political currents? Why, for instance, was Erasmus concerned that Turkish diplomats would come away with the wrong impression of Latin Christianity from their meetings with the pope? Why did he mention these foreign dignitaries in a spiritual text about how one might go about imitating Christ's suffering?

Brief profile

I am a doctoral candidate at Princeton University. Broadly defined, my research areas are in the intellectual history of early modern Catholicism, the history of emotions, and the evolution of Christological schemes. My advisor is Professor Anthony Grafton, and I have studied medieval history with Professor William Jordan and Ottoman history with Professor Molly Greene.

The original sin as an original negative emotion in Origen and Evagrius Ponticus

The original evil is, according to both Origen and Evagrius, a primordial negative emotion. The fall of man from a state of beatitude is explained as caused by boredom or negligence. It seems that the original sin is not just the sin of knowledge, but an affective or emotional sin as well.

The metaphysical implications are clear. First of all, God's goodness is saved since only His creatures are responsible for their falling. Evil comes into the world through the throes of our souls. For Origen and Evagrius the minds are to be found – in the beginning of Creation – in an equality state: all of them were in a contemplative unity with God. But, at a certain moment, despite their insatiability, some of them "faced away from Him", stricken with boredom or negligence. Evagrius exposed this conception in *Letter to Melania* and in the third tome of *Chapters on Prayer* (kept in just two Syrian versions published by Antoine Guillaumont in the 28th tome from *Patrologia Orientalis*, accompanied by French translation).

Secondly, the hierarchy is also explained: there are steps and degrees of falling according to the degrees of this evil feeling. The lowest are demons, the upper are angles and in the middle, of course, humankind. In this manner, the freedom of will is saved. The entire economy of creation is based on this feeling of saturation. Origen claims that all rational creatures formed a so-called Pre-existence Church in which they were absorbed into the contemplation of God. The origin of their fall is expressed in two manners: *koros* or *satiety*, satiety of divine contemplation, a kind of acedia, a disgust towards the spiritual and, lastly, towards all things; the second manner starts from a false etymology which associated *psyche* (soul) with *psychos* (cold). God is fire and warmth while the minds – standing away from Him – get cold and become souls. Obviously, this means a decrease in love and fervour.

Thirdly, this evil is redeemed through the instauration of contemplation's joy. The falling is not for ever, but at the end of time, the initial state of beatitude will be recovered for all entities that were maculated by this original corruption. According to Origen, the falling was not universal. Obviously, Jesus Christ was not stricken by it. He is the one who got embodied not for his expiation but for the others' salvation. We can find the same hypothesis in Origen's *Commentary on John* related to John the Baptist and in *The Prayer of Joseph* related to many patriarchs of Old Testament. All three ontological kingdoms: the kingdom of angels, the kingdom of demons and the kingdom of human beings are in the same time the Judgment's result and object; result of a primary judgment in which they received present condition and object for a final Judgment which aims to reestablish the lost primordial unity. The differing steps of angelic hierarchy are the effects of merits towards to God. Their opposite is, of course, the demons whose hierarchy uses the same names as the angelic one. Finally, humankind was less severely

involved in the fall and for it there is, at least, the hope of salvation. The world, with all that it contains, was created for man as a place for his redemption.

Conversion as an erotic experience in the period of late antiquity

This paper will examine religious conversion in the period of late antiquity as an erotic-magical experience that conferred to the convert freedom from the constraints of earthly status through his/her self-enslavement to God. In particular it will attempt to trace the continuity between philosophical and religious conversion in the passage from the Hellenistic to the Christian antiquity by exploring the magical and erotic qualities of the Word/voice. It will also examine the way that erotic Socrates and *polytropos* Ulysses served as models for the enchanter apostle Paul. Finally narcissism as a religious phenomenon will be studied by highlighting the philosophical and existential dimensions of the dematerialization and internalization of the erotic object in late antiquity. To understand the latter process mention will be made to the centrality of the Neoplatonic conceptualization of the theory of recollection in late antiquity. Also close attention will be given to the vocabulary that expresses the intuitive/erotic moment of access to a religious truth. Texts to be discussed include the Apocryphal acts of Thecla, and Andrew as well as the Platonic Theages and texts of Plutarch and Antisthenes.

Antigone Samellas

I hold a Ph.D. from Yale in history (date of graduation 1999) and that I have written "Death in the Eastern Mediterranean (50-600A.D.) (Mohr Siebeck, 2002) and Alienation: The experience of the Eastern Mediterranean (50-600A.D. (Peter Lang, 2010). Therefore the history and philosophy of emotions is my main field of research. Sincerely yours, Antigone Samellas

Westernization as Cultural Trauma: Egyptian Radical Islamist Discourse on Religious Education

The rise of radical Islamist education in various parts of the Islamic world is often presented as simply a reaction to the impact and experience of Westernization by a wide range of researchers including proponents of political Islam. It is, however, necessary to focus on the historical imagination of Westernization to understand the Egyptian reaction as manifested in Islamist religious educational discourse. The religious educational discourse in Egypt, an opportune case to observe radical Islamist response to the trauma experience, is found to be a mediating structure between the historical experience and the Islamist reaction. This study, therefore, aims to problematize the linkage between traumatic experience of Westernization and political Islam's challenge through education by pointing to the various ways in which mediating structures, agencies, and discourses have been influential in constituting the Islamist reaction.

The historical imagination appears to be based on a traumatic experience which was triggered by a traumatic event, namely British colonialism. Traumatic event causes traumatic emotions that are embedded in everyday life and unconsciously generate certain fragmented historical imagination of traumatic experience. The Egyptian traumatic process, I argue, has generated four types of emotions, namely, (1) *sense of failure*, (2) *sense of hatred*, (3) *sense of being threatened*, and (4) *a desire to be respected and to have self determination*. These four emotions are the key ones consciously or unconsciously expressed in the Islamist discourse through which radical Islamists make sense, constitute, and represent the relation between the experience of Westernization and the Islamist reaction. This, ultimately, demonstrates how the Westernization experience of Egypt has been traumatized through these emotions in the historical imagination of radical Islamists.

In this study, I seek to outline the historical imagination of radical Islamists and try to relate the traumatic Westernization experience and colonization in Egypt to a range of radical Islamist emic categories. There are four emic categories that are identified to be dominant within the religious educational discourse of radical Islamists who were interviewed during a three-month field research between April and July 2005 in Cairo, Egypt. These categories are Western cultural invasion (*al ghazo al thakafy al gharby*), moral decadence (*al en hetat al akhlaqy*), ignorance of divine guidance (*jahiliyya*) and cultural schizophrenia (*al shezofrenia al thaqafeya*). In the dialectic formation between the historical imagination of Westernization

experience and radical Islamist reaction, I intend to shed light on the crucial role of these emic categories which play a constitutive role in shaping the practice, discourse, and agency of radical Islamists in general.

48. Burcin Cakir
College of Art and Sciences
Bahcesehir University, Istanbul
burcin.cakir@gmail.com

Love, Marriage and Sexuality in Fatma Aliye's Novels

Early Ottoman novels in Turkish were also crucial means for comprehending the rationale behind regulations and institutional transformation for the Ottoman population regardless of gender although women became the center of the debate of westernization. Fatma Aliye famous for being the first well-known Muslim woman novelist created woman characters, which represent the changing and “westernizing/modernizing” emotions and manners of Ottoman women particularly focusing on plots of popular themes of Tanzimat literature such as love, compassionate vs. arranged marriages, family and sexuality. In her books such as *Namdaran-i Zenan-i Islamiyyan* (Famous Muslim Women, 1892), *Muhâzarât* (1892), *Refet* (1896), *Udî* (1898), *Levâiyih-i Hayât* (1898) and *Enîn* (1910), she had created intellectual women characters struck the borders of Islamic traditions and unavoidable impact of westernization. In terms of female emotions, manners and roles, Fatma Aliye supported the idea of formulating a synthesis of Islam and western civilization. Fatma Aliye's female characters though do not go beyond the limits of Islamic requirements, are also self-confident, and struggling portrayals that are not afraid to show their emotions and personality mainly inspired by the literature of the West that they read passionately in their spare times. When we examine the early novels of Fatma Aliye, we see that marriage and love but this time a compassionate one, became the means rather than the aim of a balanced modern life. For example, Aliye's *Levâiyih-i Hayat* depicted the contemporary values about the role of mutual love and affection in marriage. Accord in terms of chastity, manners and moral standing instead of love in its own sake are suggested as the prerequisite for spousal love and affection, and successful marriage. The carnal love and sex was condemned that cannot be a rational basis of a good marriage. She perceived sexuality and love as a romantic, unphysical and idealized way and warned audience about the dangers of “unchaste” love, that is, “carnal”. Sensual women and their bodily desire are represented as negative, provisional and evil. . We can argue that while Fatma Aliye tried to reconcile conservative and Islamic norms and approaching modernized and western ones, she gave “some” space for women to express their emotions whether she approves her female characters or not and often remained traditional. Thus, this paper aims to read through some novels by Fatma Aliye and trace the early footsteps of the expression and reflection of emotions and voices of various types of Ottoman women written by a woman.

49. Max Weiss:

To the organizers,

Please find attached my abstract for a paper on "Modernizing Happiness in the Middle East.". While I recognize that the focus of the conference is the history of emotions in pre-modernity, this paper seeks to explore the ways in which classical Islamic notions of happiness have been transformed over the course of the modern period.

Please let me know if you need anything else from me. Thank you for your consideration and I look forward to hearing from you.

Best Regards,
Max

Modernizing Happiness in the Middle East

Max Weiss

Princeton University/Harvard Society of Fellows

The vast and expanding literature on the history of emotions has helped to illuminate how emotional states such as fear, joy, anger and others, change over time. Although happiness has attracted the interest of historians working on Western contexts—and more than a little attention from psychologists and cultural critics more broadly—the history of happiness has hardly been studied by historians of the Middle East and the Islamic world. This paper explores how certain understandings and representations of happiness in the Middle East were transformed in the tumultuous transition into the modern period. Whereas a neo-Aristotelian focus on happiness as the central aim of virtuous self-making had predominated throughout the classical period, the experience of modernity in Egypt and the Levant resulted in radically reconfigured understandings of happiness. In some ways, the making of the modern self in the Arab Middle East was contingent on such reformulations of emotional states. Rather than a spiritual goal, happiness was increasingly objectified and would even become commoditized. Modernized forms of happiness, therefore, whether religious or non-religious in nature, acquired new meanings over the course of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries. In the process, the newly conceived criteria for achieving happiness created a new version of happiness that could, in turn, function as a means of modernizing the self.

Because so little work has been done on the history of emotions in the Middle East, historians have yet to determine whether the same categories of analysis employed in the study of emotions and emotionality in Western contexts ought to be applied. If we are to understand the history of happiness in the modern Middle East, it would be essential for historians and cultural critics to attend to the ways in which older Islamic concepts, categories and usages continue to inform understandings of the notion and its lived reality. In other words, an adequate history of happiness in the modern Middle East would root its analysis in concepts, orientations, texts and contexts that originate in the classical and medieval Islamic world, while also attending to the transformations,

innovations, and continuities in the deployment of the concept as well as its multiple modes of experience over the course of the modern period. This paper juxtaposes al-‘Amiri, *al-Sa‘āda wa-l-is‘ād*, Ibn Miskawayh, *Tahdhīb al-akhlāq* and other foundational texts against certain conceptual questions raised by the theoretical literature on emotions and emotionality, but also in conversation with modern religious and psychological engagements with the problem of happiness, including Salama Musa, *al-‘Aql al-batin*, *aw*, *maknunat al-nafs*, Muhammad al-Muwaylihi, *‘Ilaj al-nafs*, and Yusuf al-Dijwi, *Sabil al-sa‘ada fi falsafat al-akhlaq*. It may become possible, consequently, to consider the “problem of happiness” as a historical category, one that could have multiple streams of historical development, some within the Islamic tradition, some running in parallel, but all of which have contributed to the making of emotions and emotionality in the modern Middle East and Islamic world.

The Ways of Adaptation of European Emotional Patterns in XVIII century Russia.

The process of Westernization in Russia started in the early eighteenth century with the reforms of Peter the Great. However, during the early stages of these reforms the government that initiated this push was interested mostly in the acquisition of Western technological knowledge necessary on the battlefield and in the outward signs of Westernisation like dress, haircut and social practices. However, at the latter stages these practical approach was complemented by the drive of the members of the educated classes towards inward Europeanization, i.e. they aspired to become Europeans in the ways they think and feel. Adaptation of European emotional patterns became a decisive part of this process.

It is possible to trace several channels of this adaptation:

1. The institutions of formal education.
2. Travel abroad.
3. The activity of the lodges of Free-masons.
4. Dissemination of European art that offered a display of patterns and models of feeling.

Needless to say, these channels were complementary: the pupils of Imperial schools had to stage French plays, and free-masons were avidly reading the works of German moralists. However, each of these routes of Westernization had specific rules, codes, techniques and peculiarities that need to be analysed if we want to understand the logic of emotional Europeanization of elites in early modern Russia.

Our presentation will be focused mostly on the interplay between the third and the fourth channels. In the absence of the tradition of religious disciplining in the Orthodox Church the Masonic lodges became the major vehicle of individual self-fashioning including emotional education. Such practices as keeping of the diary, regular secular confessions before the peers, collective readings of didactic texts etc. became the powerful system of

importing Western emotional stereotypes and their interiorization. At the same time by the end of the century when these practices became widespread in Russia, the members of Russian educated elites were also avidly reading Western sentimental novels and frequenting theatres staging European plays. The emerging contradictions and resulting emotional conflicts will be discussed in the paper.

By the end of the century Russia succeeded in producing a type of educated noble that felt himself at ease among his European peers because his emotional life was structured along similar lines. The enthusiastic reception of Karamzin's *Letters of the Russian traveller* (1791) testified to the level of success of this enterprise. However, this progress only contributed to the cultural gap that existed between the social elite and the majority of the population. This gap that typical for the non-European society on the fringes of European culture played significant role in the future social and cultural upheavals in Russia.

51.

'Ajib and its derivatives as a way of expressing astonishment in the Ottoman geographical texts

Feray Coşkun

This paper will concentrate on the expression of astonishment and amazement through use of arabic term *'ajib* and its derivatives (e.g. *'ajā`ib*, *'ajibe*, *'ujāb*) in certain Ottoman geographical sources composed between the fifteenth and seventeenth centuries.

The Arabic word *'ajib* (pl. *'ajā`ib*) literally refers to an object or situation that causes astonishment. In the Qur'an, *'ajib* and its derivatives are used to denote human ignorance with regard to the scale of God's capability. In the popular Islamic cosmography tradition on the other hand, they are used to designate astonishing and admirable aspects of existence such as buildings of Antiquity, topographical features of nature and peculiarities of various nations living in the distant lands, exotic plants, minerals, animals and plants. As Zakariyā ibn Muḥammad al-Qazwīnī (d. 681/1283) defines, *'ajib* is the astonishment that befalls man because of his incapability to understand the cause of something, or its way of working. He remarks that everything created on earth has an astonishing aspect, yet people lose their curiosity and amazement after their acquaintance with objects or events, except in cases where they meet with the unfamiliar.

Having been influenced by the popular works of Islamic cosmographical tradition, the Ottoman geographical texts of pre-modernity, used *'ajib* and its derivatives to refer various astonishing aspects of the heavens and the earth. This paper will delve into this characteristic of the Ottoman geographical literature with regard to Ottoman translations of the popular cosmographies (e.g. *Ajā`ib al-Makhlūqāt wa Gharā`ib al-Mawjūdāt* of al-Qazwīnī and *Kharīdat al-'Ajā`ib wa Farīdat al-Gharā`ib* ascribed to Ibn al-Wardī), Ottoman synthetic works that composed under their influence (e.g. *Dūrr-i Meknūn* of Ahmet Bicân Yazıcızade, *Tārīh-i Hind-i Garbi* of an anonymous author) and various examples of travel literature (e.g. *Seyāhatnāme* of Evliya Çelebi or *Mirātü'l-Memālik* of Seydi Ali Reis). In doing so, it aims to shed light on the function of these terms to invoke certain emotions on their audience such as astonishment, amazement and fear.

Dr Katharine Hodgkin
Reader in Cultural History
School of Humanities and Social Sciences
University of East London
London E16 2RD

52. 'Love me or kill, me, brother': sibling relationships in early modern life-writing

Sibling relationships are sites of intense and often ambivalent emotion. They are among our primary universal relationships, and at the same time resolutely cultural in their forms and expressions. The often noted fascination with siblings on the early modern stage registers complex meanings; on the one hand the identical twins of Shakespearean comedy, with their mutual affection and transgressive interchangeability, and on the other the obsessive brother/sister love that becomes the engine of tragedy for playwrights like Webster and Ford. Such relationships may serve as an idealized model of friendship, in which the vocabulary of sisterhood or brotherhood articulates ideals of intimacy, trust and communion. At the same time, in the context of the rigorously hierarchical and gendered relationships of the early modern family, the sister/brother pair exposes the unstable centre of patriarchal authority: what control should a brother exercise over his sister, and with what limits? Relations between siblings are generationally equal; but relations between brothers and sisters, or between elders and younger, are not. Brothers and sisters, elders and younger, are hierarchically ordered within a family: at the same time they are involved with one another, close, antagonistic, both equal and unequal. In the messy actuality of families, formal hierarchies are traversed by complicated personal relationships, as well as by age and status differences.

In this paper my focus is on autobiographical accounts of sibling relationships. Personal narratives record strong emotional attachment between brothers and sisters, and at the same time register the difficult negotiation between love and jealousy, equality and authority, in those relationships. And yet much scholarship on the early modern family

has overlooked the centrality of the sibling to focus on husband/ wife or parent/child relationships. This paper aims to reinstate sibling relationships as central to family emotional life by exploring their representation in autobiographical writing of the seventeenth century. Although the paper focuses on the west, these are issues that have resonance in other cultures, past and present: both universal and historically specific, sibling relationships offer a route by which to interrogate the historicity of emotion.

Katharine Hodgkin, December 2010

53. Mirka Benes, Associate Professor of the History of Landscape Architecture, School of Architecture, University of Texas at Austin; email: mirkabenes@mail.utexas.edu

Paper Title: **"Emotion and the garden in the age of Claude Lorrain: private sentiment and public life in the villa gardens and landscapes of Rome, the Eternal City, 1550-1650."**

Emotions, sentiment, the imaginary, and the range of affective reactions, both in public and in private, have rarely, if at all, been studied for those who commissioned, used, and visited the famous villa gardens of Rome in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Instead, the associations, flights of imagination, and emotional moments of visitors to later, eighteenth-century gardens in England are much more well known in the literature on the history of gardens, through both contemporary writings and garden treatises on English gardens and modern studies. However, the villa gardens of Rome were locations and triggers of many emotions, too, and the way their forms and uses were emotionally experienced by owners and visitors will be the subject of this paper.

The emotional life of the Roman villa gardens cut across the whole social hierarchy, from the gardens of the elite, aristocratic families in Rome, such as the Farnese, D'Este, Medici, Montalto-Peretti, Borghese, Ludovisi, and Pamphilj, to those lower down on the social scale, including the humble vigna (plural: vigne) or orto (orti), vegetable gardens and orchards. Men and women, alike, expressed a range of emotions--from "diletto" (delight), "meraviglia" (marvel), joy, pleasure, to melancholy, grief, and states of imagination--, triggered both as the emotions they themselves brought to experience specifically in gardens, and by the designed elements and decorations of the villa gardens, such as antique statuary, grottoes with springs, obelisks, vast ranges of noble trees such as pines and laurels, etc. Nostalgia, freed by the associations with nostalgia for Roman Antiquity on many sites, was a key emotional experience in these gardens. This paper will document such states through contemporary letters, diaries, publications, and visual representations.

Gardens were particularly prized by women, as sites of privacy for melancholy, feelings of unwellness, recovery from illness, and places to be alone. It was also particularly in the garden that erotic trysts or walks in solitude could take place for the social classes in Rome--out of the eyesight or earshot of chaperones or servants. While the interior of the Roman house and upper-class palace were locations of "public" life, in the midst of family, servants, visitors, by contrast in the garden, men and women, together or separately, could walk by themselves, have private or secret meetings, and express their feelings. The prizing of the garden as a site of private life, in contrast to the business and publicness of life in the urban setting and household, was not unique to Rome, but was shared by other European and Eastern cultures as well. For example, in different cultural terms and gardens, French men and women used the gardens of the French chateaux and of urban promenades such as the Tuileries and Luxembourg palace-gardens in Paris as sites of recreation and of emotional experience. In effect, the definition of the Roman emotional experience of the villa garden can be put into context and relief by using inter-cultural comparisons with the emotions triggered by gardens in other cultures. In this paper, comparative examples will be drawn from the recent publication, *GARDENS AND IMAGINATION* (Washington, D.C, 2008), in which the essays by Walter Andrews and Eva Maria Subtelny on Ottoman and Persian gardens will be discussed in terms of their conceptual frameworks.

In seventeenth-century Rome, from the early 1600s on, forms of the larger landscape--such as small hills, valleys, topography, small lakes and ponds--entered the tradition of villa garden design, and with them came emotional experiences: the delight and surprise of finding new "naturalistic" forms in what had traditionally been formally-ordered gardens of hedges and regular groves of trees. Indeed, a new type of villa garden developed, what can be called the estate villa or the landscape villa, and its appearance was part and parcel of an interest in the emotional qualities that pondering and experiencing larger landscapes brought to individuals. It is no coincidence, but in fact a related development, that from the early 1600s on, Rome witnessed the rise of landscape painting as a genre, with the works of Domenichino, Claude Lorrain, Nicolas Poussin and others. The experience of the painted landscapes of Claude, in particular, was one that led to reverie, imaginary exploration, and emotions of wistfulness, transience, and transition. Experience of the contemporary villa gardens in Rome did the same in many ways, and the resulting emotional reverie occurred long before the eighteenth century English garden.

55. Homesickness of medieval Andalus: the loquacity of the poets and the silence of the scholars

Anna Akasoy

Spatial mobility is a common feature of biographies of scholars in the medieval Islamic world. In addition to the pilgrimage, they travelled 'in search of knowledge', for other professional reasons (mostly trade), because of political persecution, etc. Al-Andalus is a conspicuous case in this context since its decline as a political entity led to a substantial exodus of scholars and since a large number of bio-bibliographical compendia have been preserved from that region. Modern scholars have successfully applied quantitative analyses to these sources and reached important conclusions regarding the significance of travel for the transmission of knowledge and the formation of regional intellectual cultures in the Islamic world.

Little attention, however, has been paid to the less quantifiable side of these temporary or permanent, voluntary or involuntary movements. Questions about the emotional experience of being outside their native lands have been asked only for well-known authors of travel narratives, in particular Ibn Battuta and Ibn Jubayr. The seemingly homogeneous nature of medieval Islamic intellectual culture appears to have given scholars a home well beyond the place where they lived. Most scholars too did not comment on their experience as travelers and emigrants in writing.

On the other side of this medieval and modern silence stands the poetic expression of the Andalusí diaspora. Poets such as Ibn Shuhayd (d. 1035) composed elaborate elegies when their cities were destroyed during internal conflicts or lost to the Christian reconquistadores. While they used elements connected with the poetic topos of *hanin ila 'l-awtan* ('longing for the homelands') of the Bedouins of pre-Islamic Arabia, the Andalusí poets gave a new shape to their laments, describing, for example, the lost cities in terms of the lost beloved, a trend which had begun in Abbasid times. A possible social function of these poems may have been to console other displaced Andalusis and to encourage them to recapture their homes. As in the cases of the autobiographical statements of the travel writers, modern scholars disagree as to how to balance literary convention and 'authentic experience'. They often dismiss investigations into emotional realities as speculative and as being under the spell of modern concepts of the individual.

In the paper which I am proposing here I would like to present results of my current research project on the experience of medieval Andalusí scholars in the Eastern Mediterranean. I would like to propose an approach which brings together material from very different spheres in order to explore the silence of the medieval Andalusí scholars regarding their experience in exile. These include anthropological and sociological insights into identity formation, statements of medieval authors regarding the connection between a person and their home, literary expressions relating to homesickness and alienation, religious concepts of exile, socio-economic conditions of spatial movements and a geography of Islamic intellectual and cultural history. While the resulting approach to the emotional experience of migrating scholars may remain speculative, it will help us to re-evaluate sources and questions which so far have been considered in isolation.

56. Embodying emotions in scholasticism: what brings the East?

Around John of La Rochelle's use of Avicenna

Piroska NAGY - UQÀM, Montréal

If the global vision of soul and emotions in scholasticism has recently been studied by the synthesis of Simo Knuuttila¹, the relationship between emotions and body has never been the scope of a study. And yet, I would like to argue, it is here that lies one of the main novelties of the scholastic vision of emotions: in their embodiment. Through the study of the contribution of Avicenna to the formation of the anthropological vision of emotions in John of La Rochelle, this paper aims at studying the way this shift happens, at the very moment of the crystallisation of a new type of discourse.

John of La Rochelle was a Franciscan friar of the first generation, who became master of theology in Paris around 1236-38, as a colleague and disciple of Alexander of Hales, until their death in 1245. He wrote at least three treatises², which deal with the question emotions (if we may say, as the term is not known in the Middle Ages), at a moment when Western culture is integrating, via the new translations, the knowledge of the Greek and Arab East. Unlike patristic and early medieval anthropology which consider the “affects” only in relation with the soul, scholastic anthropology is highly interested in the relationship of soul and body.

Though the person who is generally quoted for his scholastic synthesis on emotions (as on everything else...) in Thomas Aquinas, John of La Rochelle has more than one interest for the history of medieval views on psychology and the evolution of western affective anthropology as a whole. Firstly, in his writings he is among the first to put together, even in competition, very different views of the soul and its relation to body. Besides more classical western sources, he uses John Damascene and Avicenna who complete and modify the view of western anthropology dominated by Augustinian ideas until the 12th century, especially as Avicenna brings a new awareness to body and senses. Secondly, the ideas of John of La Rochelle around the soul and – as far as we are concerned here – emotions, marked the dominant opinion of the scholastic anthropology. His writings, especially his *Summa de anima*, knew a large diffusion and were also used as a source, first by the contemporary *Summa* of Alexander of Hales or *Summa Alexandri*, but also by Albert the Great, Thomas Aquinas and Bonaventure. As far as a wider social diffusion of his ideas is concerned, they were integrated in the popular encyclopedia of Vincent of Beauvais, the *Speculum majus*, translated in the vernacular in the 14th century.

In this paper I intend to examine what the use of oriental sources brings of new to the vision of emotions of a Franciscan theologian in the second third of the 13th century and what use he makes of them. In this respect, his use of Avicenna is especially interesting, as his main writings dealing with emotions, the *Tractatus de divisione multiplici potentiarum animae* and the *De Anima* introduce the ideas of natural philosophy and medicine into a theological discourse, which becomes then truly anthropological of interest. John, conscious of the novelty, dedicates the largest place among the sources quoted in his *Summa de anima* to Avicenna. It is the use of Avicenna that brings most clearly into the scope of John the relationship between the body and emotions, especially through the senses. I would like to argue that the awareness to body in the vision of emotions comes largely from this side, and would like to show around which concrete questions, and in which very specific ways, the scholastic discourse of John embodies emotions and how it helps integrating them in a theology which becomes then a more body-minded anthropology. The last part of the paper intends to deal with the use of his texts by later authors and compendia.

¹ S. Knuuttila, *Emotions in Ancient and Medieval Philosophy*, Oxford, 2004.

² *Tractatus de divisione multiplici potentiarum animae* (ca. 1233-35), *Summa de anima* (ca. 1235-1238) and a *Summa de vitiis* (undated, probably between the two others).

**Emotions at the Crossroads.
Conversion and Diplomacy in the Early Modern French Jesuit Missions in the Ottoman
Empire**

The legitimatory discourse of French diplomacy in the Ottoman Empire made of the religious protection of Christianity one of its favorite themes, reiterated in the Capitulations and the instructions given to the ambassadors. Indeed, the development of the catholic missions was closely dependent on the influence that the French ambassadors were able to maintain at the Ottoman court. Thus, in their correspondence with Rome, ambassadors could claim to be missionaries to the same extent as the members of religious orders of whose protection they were in charge.

On the other hand, the Catholic missions, legally accepted on Ottoman territory as long as they were providing religious services to the Catholics, broadened the focus of their action in order to bring the Eastern Christians back to the papal observance. Sporadically, conversions of renegades were reported and glorified. The Jesuit missionaries' activity is reflected in their correspondence as two-sided. In the imperial capital (under the direct observation of the French diplomatic representatives) and the sieges of Eastern Christian (Greek Orthodox, Armenian, Maronite) episcopacies, it took the form of ecclesiastical diplomacy. The Jesuits generally favored the top-down approach to conversion, although it was not always efficient. At the same time, this diplomatic model of conversion left enough room for more discrete, subversive and even risky means of persuasion, periodically generating conflictual relationships with the leaders of the confessional communities, Ottoman officialties, foreign diplomatic representatives, members of other religious orders (Franciscans and Capucins), employees of the French embassy or the French ambassador himself. An interesting trajectory from this point of view is that of the Jesuit missionary Pierre Besnier, collaborator and friend of the ambassador Count de Guilleragues, whose impetuous diplomatic initiatives were nonetheless considered hazardous by Guilleragues's successor, Monsieur de Girardin, who had him sent back to France. The relations between missionaries and ambassadors or consuls were weighed on a very sensitive balance. The paternal features that diplomats attribute to the representation of their actions rely more than once on denouncing and moderating the missionaries' "dangerous zeal".

What meanings attach to this "dangerous zeal" that is so often brought forth in the administrative concerns? In trying to answer this question, we should keep in mind that "zeal" is central to the definition of the missionary vocation, and it is what best defines the affective involvement of the missionary in his action. In addition, studying the points of confluence and conflict between the two approaches of intercultural mediation might unveil interesting nuances of the early modern constant preoccupation with the *bon usage des passions*. Hence the title of this proposal, "Emotions at the crossroads," announces at the same time an attempt at measuring the affective charge in the relations between East and West and an evaluation of the distinct emotional styles that two institutions involved in this interaction – the embassy and the mission – envisaged interdependently.

As a revealing case-study, we will look at Claude Duban's correspondence from his frontier mission in Crimea at the beginning of the eighteenth century, from which, as a missionary and a *de facto* consul, he wrote to the ambassador and to his Jesuit superiors.

58. Patricia Prost (UQÀM, Montréal)

Emotions and identity in late medieval Venetian Crete through literary sources and notarial records

Owing to its multicultural context, the 14th- and 15th-century Venetian Crete is a rich investigative field to explore how the expression of emotions combines with cultural or social identity. At that time, more than one century after the colonization of the island by Venice, “Greeks” and “Latins” had lived together in Crete for a few generations already.

I propose to analyze the emotional expression of the inhabitants of Crete by considering it as a social practice. The study of social practices has indeed the great advantage of offering a perspective that goes beyond (or underneath) categories (whether ethnic or other) and that avoids their reification by highlighting their boundaries’ malleability and circumstantial character¹. Because emotions are linked to social values, I think however that their study adds an extra dimension. Indeed, cognitive psychology sees emotions as the result of the perception and evaluation process of a given situation on the basis of the subject’s goals and expectations, which are fashioned by its social environment. The concept of “emotional community”² suggests that the way in which emotions are socially perceived and the manner of expressing them, far from being cross-cultural or ahistorical phenomena, reveal groups or networks whose members share similar values.

In this paper, in order to see beyond the variations that could relate to the literary genre, I will consider the emotional vocabulary of two very different kinds of sources concerning the 14th- and 15th-century Crete. I will examine firstly the works of Cretan poets such as Stefanos Sachlikes and Marinos Phalieros, and then evaluate to what extent it is possible to compare their vocabulary and conception of emotions with that of the notarial records of the corresponding period, especially with wills and contracts of employment and apprenticeship. Taking support on the method developed by Barabara Rosenwein, my work will consist in identifying within the sources which emotions are expressed, by whom (or to whom they are attributed), towards whom (or what) and under what circumstances, in order to reveal different “emotional systems” and to associate them with affinity networks related, for instance, to the place of origin (Venice, Crete) or to other groups or networks defined by different criteria (religion, language, social status, gender etc.). Thus placed in the foreground, the study of emotional expression as a social practice should contribute to take a step back from the ethnic categorization opposing a priori Greeks and Latins that often characterizes medieval Crete’s historiography. This study is also likely to let us see some of the impacts of traumatic events such as the rebellion of 1363, which perhaps may not alter the course of individuals’ daily activities in the short run, but could all the same have affected the emotional system of certain groups or communities.

¹ As recently shown by Sally McKee, Greeks and Latins, all least those from the city of Candia, did business together on a regular basis and frequently intermarried despite the prohibitions of the Venetian regime. McKee argues that ethnic boundaries were strongly effective in certain circumstances and at certain social levels only. Otherwise, these boundaries tended to blur. Sally McKee, *Uncommon Dominion. Venetian Crete and the Myth of Ethnic Purity*, Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2000, 272 p.

² Barbara H. Rosenwein, *Emotional Communities in the Early Middle Ages*, Ithaca (N.Y.), Cornell University Press, 2006, 228 p.

59. Antonia Szabari - USC, Los Angeles

Feeling Different—The Case of Antitrinitarians in the Borderland of the Ottoman Empire

Early modern religious identities had to do with regional, institutional, and communitarian identifications and they were affective as well as knowledge based, or ideological. My paper looks at the Antitrinitarians of Transylvania and Hungary in the last third of the sixteenth and the first half of the seventeenth centuries. Antitrinitarianism [the rejection of the Christian doctrine of the trinity] emerges during the first half of the sixteenth century, but it is quickly ostracized in Western Europe. Radical reformed ideas and persons that are not tolerated in Europe, drift to the edge of Europe and into the vicinity and the borderlands of the Ottoman Empire. For a relatively brief period in the 1560's (until 1571), the Prince of Transylvania adopts a politics of religious toleration and more or less openly sides with the Antitrinitarians, who also, more than other groups, champion toleration. One of Transylvania's three ecclesiastic units was Antitrinitarian (the other two being Lutheran and Calvinist). With this supporting but unstable center (because between two empires and dominant religious regimes), Antitrinitarianism gains institutional foothold, and from this temporary center (or shelter) Antitrinitarians can move West and into the Ottoman territories of Hungary, where they vie with Catholics and Protestants.

Antitrinitarians strongly rejected both Islam (with some notable exceptions that I will briefly discuss) and "mainstream" Christian dogmas, yet I argue that it was extremely hard for them to "feel different" because of the lack of institutional support. I examine two different sources, Christological debates between Calvinist or Lutheran reformers and Anti-trinitarians that took place in front of Islamic judges and chiliastic religious literature. I argue that the vitriolic and insulting language of religious debates opens a window on the affective world of religious identity in this borderline region, where Christian debaters had carefully to balance their views and their words and pander to the kadi or a high Ottoman bureaucrat. I show that this practice takes both parties into adopting the perspective and even language of the judges, which was made possible by the development of a multi-lingual and theologically pluralistic culture in the region. I argue that pandering to the culture of the authorities is not totally alien from the theology professed by the Anti-trinitarians, which breaks up and politicizes the trinity by making Christ something like a high-ranking official. The goal was not to convince the Ottoman authorities by reasoning but to some extent to gain their sympathy. Did reformers develop actual sympathies with the Muslim authorities? The Antitrinitarian doctrine that splits up authorities served this community better than a strict Trinitarian one. Strongly rejecting their Christian adversaries, and both repulsed by and drawn to the Muslim authorities, Antitrinitarians found themselves between a rock and a hard place to which they adjusted in different ways. I try to tease out cues about their affective world by reading the Millennialist literature of the Antitrinitarians that continues to be copied in the seventeenth century.

60. REFLECTION OF THE AMBIVALENT FEELINGS FOR THE MOORS/MORISCOS IN *DON QUIJOTE*

Özlem Kumrular

The coexistence of the three religious groups in the Iberian Peninsula has never been as peaceful as it was portrayed in the written and oral literature in the Middle and Modern Ages. A notable corpus of sources shed light on the ambivalent feelings of the Spaniards towards Moors and Moriscos. Apart from folkloric data (songs, proverbs, legends, puzzles, etc), written sources (*Avisos*, document of the Holy Office, romances, popular couplets, picaresque novels, chronicles, etc.) clearly testify this amalgam of contrasting emotions and the literary corpus of Cervantes was not an exception. Cervantes, who bitterly experienced slavery in Algiers and immortalized this period of his life in his masterpiece, reflects the classical feelings of a 16th century catholic Spaniard and the astonishing conflictive/contrasting feelings. “More versed in misfortunes than in verse”, according to his own words, he does not only portray the Moors (and the other Muslims) from the perspective of an average Spaniard who was grown up with exotic Moorish tales, but also sprinkles the anti-muslim (anti-turkish/anti-moorish/anti-morisco) passages within the lines of his majestic prose. This paper aims to analyze the sentiments of one nation reduced to a single text and codified on different narrative levels.

Mail: okumrular@bahcesehir.edu.tr

Address: Özlem Kumrular

Bahçeşehir University

Çırağan Cad. Osmanpaşa Mektebi Sok.

Beşiktaş, İstanbul

Telephones: 00 90 212 381 03 25 (Office)

Please find attached my abstract for the Emotions Conference.

best regards,

Övgü Tüzün

Amerikan Culture and Literature

Bahçeşehir University

61. Pleasurable Pain: Passion and Sublime Experience in Ann Radcliffe's *The Romance of the Forest*

Published in 1791, Ann Radcliffe's *The Romance of the Forest* is a classic example of Gothic fiction that explores intense human emotions such as despair, passion, love and horror. Manipulated by extreme emotions, complex and troubled characters suffer sensational dramas throughout the narrative which comes to a close with a fairy tale ending. As Chloe Chard maintains, gothic fiction provides "an extravagant dramatization of various forms of excess and transgression, which are defined as sources of intense fascination precisely by virtue of the expressions of horror and censure which are directed towards them. Instances of the unrestrained indulgence of the passions, and of varieties of transgressive behaviour which are portrayed as the products of this unrestraint, assume a central role both in *The Romance of the Forest* and in every other work of Gothic fiction" (X).

The novel's heroine Adeline is an orphan adopted by La Motte when he is threatened by some bandits to choose between taking her with him or a certain death. As La Motte and his family are running from creditors in Paris, they are forced to take refuge in a deserted abbey which is owned by a Marquis. Marquis de Montalt, who is characterized by "the violence and criminality of his passions", is associated with the most extreme instances of unrestraint and oppression. Driven by strong passions beyond his control, the Marquis indulges in the crimes of murder and incest. The heroine herself is deeply passionate and experiences cycles of "collapse and revival": she is "reanimated with hope, and invigorated by a sense of the importance of the business before her, after a period in which "sinking under the influence of illness and despair, she could hardly raise her languid head, or speak but in the faintest accents" (Chard XXII).

Taken as a whole, the novel explores a wide range of emotions stretching from horror, fear, and awe to melancholy, despair, love and hope. Throughout the book, the experience of

severe emotional turmoil implicates the inner subjectivities of several characters who are constantly agitated by the severity of their passions. Utilizing the aesthetics-affective dynamic explored in Edmund Burke's discussion of the sublime, this paper examines how psychological and physical horror as well as the many phases of passion provide access to sublime experience in *The Romance of the Forest*.

62. "Canonized Emotions in American Culture and Literature: Addiction to Love & Fear Towards National & Global Paranoia"

Yusuf Eradam www.yusuferadam.com yusuf.erdem@bahcesehir.edu.tr

The aim of this paper is to discuss the validity and impact of the early ‘emotions’ of a young nation’s literature and culture, starting from the beginnings of American literature, exemplifying from the Puritans like Bradstreet; the Renaissance writers, romantics and transcendentalists, like Emerson, Thoreau, Poe, Melville, Hawthorne and Whitman; the realists, like Mark Twain; the naturalists like Jack London and Theodore Dreiser, and finally the late 19th Century writers and poets like Chopin and Dickinson anticipating modernism. Cultural and contextual symbols, images, signifiers, themes from canonized American works of literature that find their way into classes through major anthologies like Heath & Norton to the most popular and cult movies of Hollywood will be under discussion. The significance of metaphor, allusion, allegory and irony and the formation of universal symbols and archetypes via local, cultural and contextual symbolism towards a global memory of love and fear, towards global paranoia will be part of the thesis statement of this paper and that this memory, archive is/has proven to be the most influential vehicle of convergence culture showing only one center, which is a most important strategy towards global obedience culture.

Emotions East and West, Istanbul 2011

(En)gendering shame in early modern Swedish Lutheran society

Jonas Liliequist, Dr. Associate Professor, Umeå University

Repentance, confession of guilt, and faith in the Gospel of Christ were the hallmarks of Lutheran theology in the age of Reformation. The road to absolution should basically be an interior process without the outward manifestations of penance or the imposing of rituals and punishments connected with shame. Another basic principle was the spiritual equality between men and women. However in both the Church's and the State's judicial practice based on the Law of God, shame became one of the basic mechanisms for regulating social life and in certain contexts also evolved as highly gendered. The purpose of this paper is to give an outline of the gendered aspects of shame in early modern Sweden as a first step toward comparison in an East - West perspective.

Dear colleagues,

Please find attached my abstract "Early modern emotions and colonialism - perspectives from East and West" for the 2011 CHEP conference "Emotions East and West" in Istanbul. My historical research concerns early modern emotions in a number of contexts, but I decided to trial a pilot study for your conference which is specifically on the comparison of emotions in East and West.

Please don't hesitate to contact me if you have any queries.

I look forward to hearing from you.

Kind regards,
Jacqueline Van Gent

Dr Jacqueline Van Gent
Women's Studies
Medieval and Early Modern Studies
School of Social and Cultural Studies M 202
The University of Western Australia
35 Stirling Hwy
Nedlands, WA 6009
Australia
Tel: 08 6488 2117
Fax: 08 6488 1030

Emotions East and West
Istanbul 29 September – 1 October 2011

Early modern emotions and colonialism – perspectives from East and West

Jacqueline Van Gent

Stephen Greenblatt argued a decade ago that the hallmark emotions of early modern colonial encounters were marvel and wonder which served to justify European possession of the New World. These emotions may represent a part of the European experience, but it was perhaps not a common one and it begs the question of how colonized societies emotionally responded to dispossession. In this paper I will explore how early modern colonial encounters were emotionally associated with particular objects and how these are used (or not) in modern museum displays. I will draw in my discussion on empirical material of museum exhibitions concerning colonial encounters of the West (Netherlands, Portugal) with the East (Malacca) and compare the museum displays in Malacca with their counter parts in the Netherlands and Portugal.

Malacca, a Malaysian state, became a recognized UNESCO heritage site in 2008. In the early modern period Malacca changed from being a Malay fishing village to becoming a significant Sultanate under Sultan Iskandar Shah (died in 1424). On August 24, 1511 Alfonso de Albuquerque conquered Malacca and established Portuguese colonial rule which lasted until 1641 when the Dutch captured Malacca with the help of the Sultan of Johore. Malacca's rich early modern past is exhibited in numerous museums and exhibition spaces: for example the replica of the Sultanate palace of Sultan Manshur Shah (reigned 1456-1477), the Portuguese fort A Famosa

(built in 1511) or the Dutch Stadthuys (constructed in 1650) which today houses the Museum of History and Ethnography.

This wide cultural, religious, ethnic and political spectrum of its early modern past raises the question of how these experiences are emotionally conveyed and visually represented in objects. In order to explore the meanings of early modern emotions as crucial historical forces in colonial encounters I will address the following questions: How do objects reflect emotions of early modern colonizers and colonized groups? How do they differ in their representations of the various colonial regimes? How do museums represent the complex social and emotional arrangements of early modern period colonial rule? How do they differ between the different exhibition spaces and places of memory, eg the Sultanate palace, the Dutch town hall or the Portuguese fort? Whose experiences and emotions are represented and whose are neglected?

In the second part of my paper, moving from East to West, I will ask how the Malacca museum representations compare with the way in which the former colonial powers, the Netherlands and Portugal, exhibit their early modern presence in Malacca. What emotions are here emphasized and which objects are used to signify these historical experiences?

Dear Sir,

Please find enclosed my abstract for the CHEP 2011 Conference. I would like appeal for consideration even though the date line for sending the abstract has passed.

Regard

Prof. Dr. Mohammad Redzuan Othman

Dean

Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences

University of Malaya

Kuala Lumpur

MALAYSIA

FROM EMOTION TO ADMIRATION: THE MALAYS PERCEPTION OF THE SUPREMACY OF THE TURKS AND ITS SIGNIFICANCE BEFORE THE DEMISE OF THE OTTOMAN EMPIRE

The Islamisation of the Malays and its subsequent social and political influences also introduced Turkish elements into their life. The Ottoman military supremacy and the great empire that they controlled caught the Malays' early imagination which took the form of admiration manifested in several early Malay literary works. Despite the fact that these traditions mentioned a long history of association with the Turks, existing evidence shows that the relation between them was only well established in the sixteenth century after Melaka was invaded by the Portuguese in 1511. Subsequently, Aceh in northern Sumatra emerged as an important centre of Islam in the Malay World and fostered a diplomatic relation with the Turks.

The early seventeenth century saw the decline of the Ottoman Empire, but the emotion made the Malay continued to admire the Turks. In the case of Aceh many Turkish cannons were preserved and Turkish flag was adopted as their own by the Acehnese Sultans. Apart from this, a number of religious practices related to the Ottoman also prevailed, including the used of the title *Shaykh al-Islam*, an office which held the highest authority in religious affairs by some Malay states and the use of *Majallat al-Ahkam al-Adliyyah* in civil administration. The Malay emotion of the Turks, however was in the state of confusion when Kemal abolished the Ottoman Caliphate in 1924.

Professor Dr. Mohammad Redzuan Othman
Dean
Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences
University of Malaya
Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.
7 December 2010

To : Organizing Committee

Due to delay in getting the Arabic text, I apologize for being late to send my abstract. Hope it is not too late. Awaiting your reply.

Samia Abou Alam

TITLE : Emotions of Dryden and Etman's Cleopatra -
A multicultural study.

ABSTRACT : In All For Love (1678), John Dryden treated the same subject as in Shakespeare's Antony and Cleopatra, yet both writers worked within a different set of conventions and for different purposes. Dryden admits in the Preface to his play that he tried to follow the practice of the ancients. Thus, with the use of different technical devices, he explains that the mutual love of the two characters, being founded upon vice must lessen the favour of the audience to them. As a result, Shakespeare's Cleopatra, with her infinite variety, is converted with the classical touch of Dryden into a paragon of chastity and constancy. Therefore, the real lovers whom we meet in the original play, become in Dryden's heroic types uttering conventional sentiments and emotions.

On the other hand, in Cleopatra Worships Peace (1984), Ahmed Etman, Professor of Classical Literature in Egypt, sets out to depict Cleopatra from a modern perspective where she transcends being a historical authentic figure and becomes a symbol of Egypt. As such she becomes the bridge, rather than the barrier, between cultures. He, therefore, constructs an Egyptian Cleopatra whose emotional life constitutes merely one important aspect of her character.

Thus, these two writers, in spite of their different cultures, have used the theme of love to reconstruct a new play based on the classical Shakespearean romantic tragedy Antony and Cleopatra.

Through a comparative study of both plays, Dryden and Etman's, this paper aims, by using different cultural perspectives, to prove that both writers have worked towards the same target to prove the necessity of emotions in building a multicultural landmark in literature.

Samia Abou Alam
Lecturer
Faculty of Arts,
Helwan University.
Egypt.

Alexandra Bergholm, PhD
Department of Early and Medieval Irish
University College Cork
Cork, Ireland

alexandra.bergholm@helsinki.fi

RITUALS OF MOURNING IN EARLY MEDIEVAL IRELAND

In the Middle Ages, the relationship between the living and the dead was defined by Christian doctrine concerning the afterlife and the posthumous destinies of souls, but the Church's rise to authority did not replace earlier traditions with immediate effect. Many beliefs and practices related to death, in particular, had stability and resilience, which resulted in discrepancies and adaptations between Christian teaching and popular practice.

The purpose of this paper is to explore the implications of this coexistence within the cultural context of early medieval Ireland, by addressing the question of how the dynamics of different beliefs and practices surrounding death are reflected in the early Irish literary record. The discussion outlines the range of ritualised expressions of grief and mourning which may be traced in the source material, and sets them within the wider cultural context of early medieval funerary practices. The evidence of early Irish sources will be considered from a comparative perspective, which seeks to elucidate the significance of these rituals as a form of social behaviour. It will be argued that the cultural configurations pertaining to death throw into relief the whole complexity of the symbolic, pragmatic and emotional aspects of human social existence. Therefore, paying attention to a society's attitudes towards death may give us a better understanding of the most basic values that underlie the structure of the society, while also highlighting the intermingling of emotional conventions and norms existing in a given community.

The Cultural History of Emotions in Pre - modernity II

Emotions East and West

Istanbul, Sept. 29 - Oct. 01, 2011

Encoding / decoding of emotions in ecclesiastical court proceedings (1600-1783)

by Andrea Griesebner

In the Habsburg Monarchy the Catholic Church held the authority over marriage jurisdiction until 1783. In contrast to the churches of Protestant denominations, the Catholic Church considers marriage a sacrament. Sexual intercourse (*copula carnalis*) was supposed to found a bond of matrimony, dissoluble only by the annulment of the marriage, or by the death of a spouse. This doctrine was adopted by the Marriage Ordinance of Emperor Joseph II, which conferred the marriage jurisdiction to secular courts in 1783. Until the introduction of civil marriage – in Austria as late as 1938 – catholic marriages could not be divorced. The only option available was a separation from bed and board. Since leaving the bond of marriage intact, remarriage was forbidden.

In my paper I will investigate separation and cohabitation proceedings from the 17th to the 19th century in the archduchy Austria below the Enns, encompassing present-day Vienna and Lower Austria. This regional choice is due to the availability of sources; marginal territorial shifts within the area of study and the possibility to compare metropolitan, small-town and rural conditions.

Until 1783 mainly two dioceses and therefore two ecclesiastical courts were in charge: the court of the lower Officialat of the bishopric of Passau and the court of the diocese of Vienna, both located in the city of Vienna. The protocols of both ecclesiastical courts have survived almost entirely from the 17th century onward. The Passau protocols were dealing with spouses from the countryside, the majority of suits concerning the break of the marriage vow (*sponsalia*) and requests for dispensation. The Viennese consistory had to deal more often with demands for cohabitation, for separation or for extending the “time of tolerance”, during which the couple was allowed to live separately.

The spouses, respectively their advocates, narrated their marriage experiences, and in cases of separation explained why they could not live together any longer. When asking for cohabitation, they explained why the spouse living separately should be ordered to resume conjugal life. The arguments brought forward are very diverse and do not only refer to the arguments qualifying for a separation within canon law. In my paper I will draw the attention to emotions, which so far have been neglected frequently as motivation for separation or divorce. While hints of callousness, lack of affection, as well as hatred and disgust, are detectable in the ecclesiastical court protocols, lack of love or missing fondness is seldom explicitly articulated, but is evident in complaints about insufficient or bad food, or the refusal of sexual duties.

As Rainer Beck already suggested in 1997, illiterate persons from rural areas often were deficient in sophisticated vocabulary to express their feelings. I will therefore also focus on the emotional coding of practices. How did the mentioning of and speaking about emotions change during the period of investigation? Are there any traceable differences between persons from divergent social strata, between the sexes, between urban and rural societies?

Ao. Univ. Prof. Dr. Andrea Griesebner is a scholar of cultural and feminist history. The focus of her research is on the intersection of legal, criminal, body and gender history from the 17th to the 19th century. She also teaches and publishes on issues of theory and methodology of history and feminist theory.

Ways of Dealing with Authority: Irony and Sarcasm in Ottoman Women's Poetry

Didem Havlioğlu¹

Women poets were exceptional and marginal throughout Ottoman literary history based on the overwhelming majority of male poets and the way women poets were conceptualized in the critical venues such as biographical dictionaries. The biographers constructed a discourse for talking about the women poets from 15th century onwards. As they developed this discourse, it became an elaboration of a sexually explicit language, spiced up with a lot of humor. Unlike male poets' entries, women poets were described based on their physical qualities such as their virginity. On the other hand, women poets curiously used an ironic, if not sarcastic, tone when they deal with the suspicious attitude towards their morality. For instance, this tone is clear when they respond to male poets who put them in the position of the beloved. It is possible to trace the historical development of the ironic tone of the women poets' voice, from the early modern women poets such as Mihri Hatun to the modern poets such as Leyla Hanım and Şeref Hanım. This paper tackles with questions such as the cultural acceptability of sarcasm and irony as ways of expressing anger, frustrations and resentment. Furthermore, it discusses the possibility of a community of women poets constructed around mutual emotions. By analyzing the poetic language used by a variety of poets from 15th to 20th centuries, this paper intends to shed light onto women poets' works written in the ironic tone as a way to deal with the male authority and how collective emotions can help create a community.

¹ Assistant Professor, İstanbul Şehir University, Turkish Language and Literature

Didem Z. Havlioğlu

Yrd. Doç. Dr./Assist.Prof.

Türk Dili ve Edebiyatı Bölümü/
Department of Turkish Lang. & Lit.

İstanbul Şehir Üniversitesi

t: 0 216 559 90 81

f: 0 212 282 66 27

ABSTRACT

“Benedictines and changing attitudes towards intellectual curiosity in the Age of Enlightenment”

Linn HOLMBERG, PhD student in history of sciences and ideas, Umeå University, Sweden.

Intellectual curiosity often roused suspicion in medieval and early-modern Europe. It was commonly seen as a form of lust and as the impulse that once had caused the Fall of Man.

In 1791 dom Jean Mabillon, Benedictine of the French Reform-Congregation Saint-Maur, published a normative treatise on monastic studies (*Traité des études monastiques*) which became very influential in its time. He wrote that a monk could consult practically any type of work if he only could resist yielding into his personal passions, to vanity or to curiosity for curiosity's sake. But even with the right disposition there were areas of study, or certain 'curiosities', that was unsuitable for the monastic state, such as physics, mathematics and medicine.

In the Seventeenth Century the writers of the Congregation Saint-Maur, known as the Maurists, became famous for their many publications within patristics and ecclesiastical history. During the Eighteenth Century their literary activities transformed, and they increasingly oriented themselves towards general history and the humanities. However, there were also those who came to devote themselves to sciences and arts. In the prefaces of the early works within this category one finds the same warning words regarding curiosity, but by the mid-Eighteenth Century the prefaces change their tone. In 1747, two Maurists published a translation of Christian Wolff's mathematical works and added a preface that applauded the natural curiosity of man. The same year these two monks started to work on a universal dictionary of sciences and arts. Throughout its 1 5000 folios, the authors plunge into the curiosities of nature, sciences and arts, without any explicit religious justifications, and repeatedly addressing themselves to the curious, *les curieux*, of the century.

With this presentation, I wish to discuss the changing attitudes towards curiosity during the eighteenth century using the Benedictines of the Congregation-Saint Maur as an example.