

The Cultural History of Emotions in Pre-Modernity II
Emotions in East and West
Istanbul, September 29- October 1, 2011
Zeynep Nevin Yelce

Summaries

THURSDAY (29/09/11)

I. SESSION: Encounters and Intercultural exchange
(Chairperson: Hakan Erdem)

Piroska Nagy - *Embodying emotions in scholasticism: what brings the east*

Piroska Nagy discussed the new interest in the Eastern treatises such as the works of Avicenna arouse in the West and emphasized that the neglected question of the relation between body and emotion came to the surface. As such, emotions came to be seen as “movements of soul” in the medieval “West”. Nagy supported the argument through examples from the *Summa de Anima* of the thirteenth-century western theologian John of la Rochelle according to whom emotions are motions of soul, voluntary movements accompanied by bodily changes, a conclusion based on Avicenna. Nagy argued that twelfth and thirteenth-century Eastern writers brought new ways of seeing, and became a catalyst for a change that was already happening in the West.

Adina Ruiu - *Emotions at the Crossroads. Conversion and Diplomacy in the French Jesuit Missions in the 18th century Ottoman Empire*

The focus of Adina Ruiu’s presentation was the Levantine missions representing Catholic longing to return to the beginning of Christianity. Ruiu raised the question whether the desire to become a missionary should be detached from territorial concerns? While easiness to convert was a main criterion in choosing the location of the missionary activity textual examples were not to be isolated from mission itself. Ruiu also dwelled on the association of emotion and subjectivity, exemplified by the feelings of a missionary who feels as a victim of a conspiracy as he arrived at his initial designation after 15 years of waiting. Arguing that it is not possible to speak of a single West or East, Ruiu asserted that colonial construction was not based on reason but emotions “dealing”.

Patricia Prost - *Emotions and identity in late medieval Venetian Crete through literary sources and notarial records*

Exploring the emotional vocabulary of two texts from the Manuscript of Marciannus Graccus (1247), a single combination of two independent texts, Patricia Prost traced the convergence of two different theological routes. Prost emphasized that by the fourteenth century Creten society already experienced an interaction between Venetians and Greeks such as marriages though prohibited by Venice. Prost first examined the text by St. Francis of Assisi who was very popular both among the Catholic and the Orthodox communities of Crete and asserted that St Francis was associated with strong emotions such as suffering, weeping, and natural tenderness as well as matters of the heart. The second text, on the other hand, condemned celebration, advising going to church and experience the joy of Soul.

Mehmet Kalpaklı & Özden Mercan - *Emotional Reflections of 1453: East and West*

The presentation of Kalpaklı and Mercan focused on the description of the conquest of Constantinople in 1453 by the humanists of West as source of grief. Kalpaklı and Mercan underlined expressions of regret such as “I wish I was there instead of experiencing this” and propagandistic portrayals of Turks as “enemy of culture” or “barbarians who ravaged the prosperity and beauty of Constantinople” as well as reception of the conquest as a sign of punishment from God. In the process of creating “the enemy” humanists employed emotions such as fear, anger, and revenge. Kalpaklı and Mercan defined the Humanists in this context as an emotional community as they were united in a common discourse with a shared vocabulary. In the East, on the other hand, the same event was portrayed as a victory and presented as ghaza, a religious movement against infidels, or the arrogant Christians who were described as filthy and malicious. Thus ghaza and joy were the common themes regarding this issue in context of the East.

II. SESSION: Visual, musical, and spatial representation (Chairperson: Suraiya Faroghi)

Ash Niyazioğlu - *Fear and Pleasure at a Sixteenth-Century Ottoman Garden*

Through an analysis of the dreams of the executed sixteenth-century Ottoman poet Figani, Niyazioğlu questioned whether it would be possible to draw the emotional topography of the imperial capital. For Niyazioğlu, Figani's representation of the city's gardens as places of sorrow and fear at a time when new forms of socialization began to emerge is a possible crack through which we can glimpse into the mental landscape of sixteenth-century Istanbul.

Elena Bonesi - *A proposal for codification of the iconography of sorrow in Early Modern Western Europe (Giovanni Bonifacio)*

Analyzing the work of seventeenth-century Italian jurist Giovanni Bonifacio, Elena Bonesi examined the expressions of sorrow and pain. She compared these expressions and gestures to a corresponding picture from the same period to relate the written word to painted reflections. Bonesi's presentation was an attempt at building a vocabulary of sorrow for the Early Modern period. [from the abstract]

Lale Uluç - *Actions expressing emotions: Jealousy in sixteenth-century Shiraz manuscripts*

Lale Uluç's presentation focused on the visual representation of a specific emotion, namely jealousy. Uluç analyzed several miniatures from various sixteenth-century Shiraz manuscripts and demonstrated how jealousy was represented in manuscript illuminations. This presentation also provided insight on actions signifying jealousy.

Maria Dolores Tena Medialdea - *The theory of Carnival and the Ottoman Professional Dance*

Medialda introduced a gender perspective in her analysis of Ottoman professional dance. She suggested approaching the bodily image, dance features and audience perceptions as semiological signs. [from the abstract]

III. SESSION: Gender (Chairperson: Tülay Artan)

Camilla Schjering - *Wellsprings & Sediment: Reflections on traditional, popular, and early music: An approach to the cultural history of emotions*

Schjering analyzed the intersections between gender, emotions, and feelings of right and wrong in late eighteenth-century Copenhagen. On the basis of materials from civil and police courts, she uncovered the norms such as morality and virtue which were shaped by emotions. Schjering emphasized the role of emotions in the formation of moral norms and social relationships, regardless of one's gender and social hierarchy.

Selim Kuru - *Zuleyha's Feelings: Expressions of Love and Carnal Desire as Contrasting Feelings in Yusuf and Zuleyha Stories in Ottoman Literature*

Focused on Yusuf and Zeliha story, whose Ottoman version was written by the late fifteenth-century poet Hamdi, Kuru's presentation raised some important questions such as: How were emotions are controlled? How were they channeled through writings? How were some emotions – "love" in this story – culturally constructed? Looking at Zeliha and her "love" for Yusuf, Kuru argued that her love had a crafted nature and that since the emotion was not controlled by the subject but instead commanded her she was an object. The three dreams experienced by Zeliha through the story was a demonstration of the idea that she was subjected to a twist of fate.

Didem Havlioğlu – *Ways of dealing with authority: Irony and sarcasm in Ottoman women's poetry*

In her talk, Havlioğlu questioned the Ottoman literary history with a new and feminist approach as she discussed the case of Ottoman women poets. She argued how women poets used an ironic language as a way of resisting to male authority. By analyzing the poets from the fifteenth to the twentieth century, Havlioğlu challenged the overwhelming majority of male poets and told about the distinct poetic language that women poets used in their works.

Jonas Liliequist - *Engendering Shame in early modern Swedish Lutheran society*

Jonas Liliequist's presentation focused on gendered stereotypes of shame and gendered meaning of shaming. Liliequist discussed the gendered vocabulary involved in the process, as women associated with unchaste behavior were called a "whore" and defined "shameless". Men associated with dishonesty, on the other hand, were called a "thief" and defined as a rogue, infamous, and without honor. Liliequist, thus, drew attention to the transformations and associations, as exemplified through expressions such as "you lied like a whore" or "you hit me like a rogue".

FRIDAY (30/09/11)

IV. SESSION: Ethics

(Chairperson: Guido Ruggiero)

Nira Pancer - *Merovingian Honor as an exchange of emotions*

Pancer, in her speech, dealt with Merovingian honor with reference to the special link

between honor and exchange among aristocrats. There were no clear-cut lines among aristocracy which became evident from exchange of goods or gift-giving through ceremonies. Emotions were the dynamics of honor. Emotions of cooperation, conflict, anger, and shame were most important aristocratic social expressions. Accordingly, she put forward that honor of clan or family came before obeying the king.

Kristine Steenbergh - *Structures of feeling and early capitalist culture: Philip Massinger's City Madam (1632)*

Steenbergh mentioned personal and incidental aspects of structure of feeling in early capitalist culture. In this culture, lending money at an interest and usury were the basic dynamics of the newly emergent structure. Then, she tried to show how these mechanisms were reflected in the theater of the time. In this respect, she based her argument on Philip Massinger's play of *City Madam* which is representative for feeling structures in early capitalist culture.

Linn Holmberg - *Benedictines and changing attitudes towards intellectual curiosity in the Age of Enlightenment*

Holmberg's study was based on 700 texts written by church fathers. She started with the link between curiosity and the concepts such as arts, crafts, and sciences. The main issue that she problematized was how the perception of curiosity changed from a harmful or bad concept to something intellectual. Before the eighteenth century, curiosity was something negative since it led people to be no longer masters of their minds. In the eighteenth century, however, curiosity came to be worthier than anything.

**V. SESSION: Westernization, Ottomanization, and Colonialism
(Chairperson: Karin Adahl)**

Andrei Zorin - *The ways of adaption of European emotional patterns in eighteenth-century Russia*

Focusing on the creation of imperial educational institutions, possibilities for members of the state elite to travel abroad and the function of the Free-mason lodges in facilitating the diffusion of such patterns, Zorin discussed the various channels by which the Russian elite began adopting European emotional patterns in the eighteenth century. Peter the Great (Peter I) in his reign started to change the appearance and practices of elites using education which was focused on giving not only necessary skills but also moral education thus reshaping them. Thus he tried to create a new generation with new values different than those their parents had and created isles of Europeanization in a very non-European environment. Categorized in two groups as textual and social communities, these elites constituted an emotional community who validate or invalidate same type of values. Their social community was very Russian thus very national as they were part of the elite of society which included only Russians while their textual community was international, linked with European values, for example the idea of Masonic brotherhood which was already widespread among Europeans become popular within this elite circle too which prompted them to keep diaries of their sins and shared it with their community. These diaries were an encyclopedia of emotions.

Jacqueline Van Gent - *Early modern emotions and colonialism – perspectives from East and West*

Focusing on examples from Malaysian culture, Jacqueline Van Gent argued that museum objects can be used as signs of authority or as signs of resistance depending on the

perspective. In a museum at the city of Malacca in Malaysia, a pre-Islamic object was believed to be magically endowed with reference to the deities and used by the rulers to show their legitimacy. It was used to emphasize core values of obedience and loyalty of their culture without any reference to the colonial context. The object was employed as a de-historialized object reflecting a strong state message in an inoffensive way to the Dutch and the Portuguese. While a museum in Netherlands, focusing on the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries when Dutch ruled Malaysia, exhibited nothing about Malaysia.

VI. SESSION: Passions and Impressions

(Chairperson: Aşlı Niyazioğlu)

Övgü Tüzün - *Pleasurable Pain: Passion and Sublime Experience in Ann Radcliffe's The Romance of the Forest*

Focusing on the psychological evaluation of *The Romance of Forest*, a novel by Ann Radcliffe, Tüzün analyzed the work through different emotion types such as love, horror passion, or some severe emotions like melancholy with reference to the different contexts in which these emotions were situated in the novel. Then, she discussed the issue of femininity and emotions in novels in general.

Michael D. Sheridan - *Forms Wondrous and Strange: Pity, Contempt and the Grotesque in Evliya Çelebi's Book of Travels*

Sheridan followed textual clues to trace the emotions that Evliya Çelebi used. He showed that *acaib* (wondrous and strange) constitutes an important part of Evliya's book of travels. Sheridan classified Evliya's representations of the world in two; namely ordinary and extraordinary. He tried to show how emotions evolved in Evliya's text. Accordingly, he mentioned distortion, abnormality, and dehumanized elements as some methods of expression used by Evliya.

Feray Coşkun - *Ajib and its derivatives as a way of expressing astonishment in the Ottoman geographical texts*

Coşkun dealt with the issue of *acaib-garaib* in Islamic cosmographical tradition, based on Ottoman examples from the sixteenth century. She took *acaib* as a geographical literature genre and showed how astonishing aspects of Hellenism and ancient world were represented in *acaib* works. She also discussed the uses of different terms for *acibe* appealed to different geographies. Coşkun also demonstrated that *aciba* was among the most frequently copied works in Ottoman world.

Özlem Kumrular - *Reflection of the Ambivalent feelings for the Moors/Moriscos in DON QUIJOTE*

Kumrular talked about the Muslim world on the Iberian Peninsula. For her study, she benefited from written sources, novels and chronicles. Focusing on metaphorical meanings, Kumrular mentioned the approach towards Moors and Turks in the works of Cervantes in which Turks were included the Turkish or any other Muslims while Moors signified those coming from Africa. Kumrular underlined the absence of dehumanization and the employment of an inoffensive tone. However, she demonstrated that unheroic terms were attributed to Moors and Turks.

VII. SESSION: Tears and Crying (Chairperson: Esther Cohen)

Johan Vekselius – *East and West – Tears and cultural identity in Polybius*

Johan Vekselius took the *Histories* of the Greek historian as a starting point for a discussion of Greek tears during the Hellenistic period and the tears of the Romans. He argued that tears should be regarded as cultural motifs (*topoi*), as well as literary motifs, as they reflected a set of ideas, mentalities, attitudes, dispositions, behaviors, and practices. Putting Polybius beside the Roman historian Livy, Vekselius questioned the differences between tears of the Greeks, the Romans, and the “barbarians”. [from the abstract]

Kirsi Kanerva – *The exceptional tears: Aspects of Male expression of grief in medieval Iceland*

Kirsi Kanerva’s talk dealt with Medieval Icelandic literature in the light of Icelandic Saga. She followed an examination of gender portrayals with a comparison of two sagas narrating the same event. Kanerva argued that the two sagas differed in the way that they represented male expressions of grief. [from the abstract]

Olga Vyshegorodtseva - “Moaning caravan” and “weeping nightingale”: personal and collective sorrow in pre-modern Anatolian Alevi community

Focusing on sixteenth-century Alevism, Vyshegorodtseva claimed that the Alevi community was built on “sorrow”. Poetry was used to reflect suffering, as it renders suffering legible and made community exist through formulating a common identity. She dwelled on the employment by the legendary Alevi poet Pir Sultan Abdal of the “caravan” metaphor which in oriental poetry functions as an image of the treasures of life but here used as “Caravan laments”. She argued that the caravan, in this sense, symbolizes the Caravan of the Twelve Imams, thus reminding the sufferings of Kerbela. As such, the “lamenting caravan” as a metaphor legitimized the suffering of all Alevis.

Jebro Lit - *Debating Jesus’ Tears: Christology in the Spiritual Writings of the Northern Humanists, 1500-1525*

Jebro Lit focused on a major debate between Catholics and Protestants during sixteenth century, namely the debate about the humanity of Jesus. Lit dwelled on the Protestant claim that Jesus had not sinned when he had a body, but gained human emotions to explain why Jesus cried before Lazarus miracle when he knew all.

Dana Sajdi - *The worst affliction is the one that makes you laugh: humor and politics in Early Modern Arabic narrative genres*

The main focus of Dana Sajdi’s talk was an Arabic text written by an eighteenth-century Damascene barber, which conveys a political message on the importance of being honest. Sajdi dwelled on the general characteristics of chronicles written in classical Arabic and Arab epics. While chroniclers aimed to act protectors of the Islamic polity with their texts intended to be read aloud to an exclusive group of people such as important officials, epics were authorless and of oral nature, possessed very fluid content, and narrated in the streets to the public. The epic figured as a history of a disaffected people, bemoaning loss of order and

reflected the longing for a hero. The text under focus, combining several genres which existed in eighteenth-century Damascene society, could be regarded as a testimony for the beginning of journalistic culture which was yet to come.

VIII. SESSION: Images of Love

(Chairperson: Walter Andrews)

Anna Foka - *From Lais to Theodora: anecdotal manipulative courtesans from late antiquity to early Christianity*

Anna Foka's paper focused on Athens in the fourth century BC, the heyday of courtesans. In late antiquity courtesans were humored as emotional manipulators. In ancient Greece courtesans had no status. Described as manipulative and greedy, courtesans were believed to have faked good manners such as refinement, and to have tried to control minds via positive reinforcement. In Christianity by ridiculing courtesans people tried to justify their own morality.

Karolina Enquist Källgren - *Love between religions in medieval Spain*

Källgren dwelled on the epistemological connotations of love in Christianity and Islam. She put forward religious debates about love for which she listed different approaches such as literalist, rationalist, and mystical views. The most important aspect of this debate was the soul, especially the union of soul and body. Soul was regarded as an intermediary for the knowledge of God.

Samia Abou Alam - *Emotions of Dryden and Etman's Cleopatra - A multicultural study*

Samia Abou Alam analyzed the different perceptions of Cleopatra in various sources between the seventeenth and the twentieth century. She mentioned women's sources of anxiety for men. Abou Alam stressed the difference between Medieval and Renaissance literature, in which women were more likely to express emotions than men, and Early Modern literature in which men's emotions came to be more prevalent. According to the Abou Alam, social class, ethnic background, and age were the main factors determining emotional registers.

Tülay Artan - *Letters of Love and Jealousy: Private Whisperings from the Ottoman Court*

Tülay Artan presented an examination of letters between Sultan Ahmed III and Damad İbrahim Pasha. Quite affectionate in character, these letters demonstrated an exchanging of confidence in a very male way on a woman in common Fatma Sultan, Ahmed III's daughter and İbrahim's wife. Full of details and emotions, the letters are very direct and they make us curious to explore what people felt. Artan also drew attention to what needed to be said in the letters as well as what was not said.

IX. SESSION: Medical Theories and the Body

(Chairperson: Jonas Liliequist)

E.N. Anderson - *Emotions East and West in Medieval China*

Presenting field research on Chinese fisherfolk, E.N. Anderson dwelled on the individual-in-society view running through all Chinese history. Anderson emphasized the co-existence of continual contact with the West along with a strong history of independence in emotional life and emotional responses. [from the abstract]

Paul D. Buell - *Emotions in a fifteenth-century Chinese Encyclopedia of Arabic medicine*

Paul D. Buell introduced a compendium of Arabic medicine in China. He focused on material connected with emotions, particularly Arabo-Persian and Chinese terminology. [from the

abstract]

Angelika Messner - *Emotions and emotion-knowledge in Chinese history*

Exploring the anthropological significance of the emotions in China in the period ca. 1500-1800, Angelika Messner dealt with the descriptions of emotions in contemporary medical sources in order to shed light on the material realities of emotions. Drawing attention to longstanding misconceptions in regard to emotions in the East (China), she discussed the possibilities and limits of European and Eastern (Chinese) perspectives on the emotions [from the abstract]

Michael Stolberg - *Emotions and Early Modern Body: Medical theories and lay experience*

Michael Stolberg focused in medical theories and lay perceptions of the emotions in Early Modern Europe, emphasizing that emotions and passions were described above all as bodily phenomena. He supported his findings through private letters and autobiographies as well. Drawing on recent work in cultural anthropology and the history of emotions Michael Stolberg argued that emotions are culturally framed and constructed. [from the abstract]

SATURDAY (01/10/11)

**X.SESSION: Communication and Literary Styles
(Chairperson: Mohammed Fazlhashemi)**

Zeynep Altok - *Sixteenth- and Seventeenth-Century Ottoman Biographies of Poets and the banishment of emotions from the space of writing*

Based on Ottoman collective biographies, Altok followed the traces of emotions through biographies of several Ottoman poets such as Ahmed Paşa, Necati, Mufti, Latifi, Rıza and Hasan Çelebi. As a general thesis, she proposed that the space of writing was dominated by a limited intellectual elite in sixteenth century. This limited elite reflected a variety of emotions in their biographies ranging from sexual habits to daily rivalries. However, the space of writing extended as a result of several factors such as the increase in literacy.

Tilmann Walter - *Communicating emotions in Pre-Modern scholars' letters*

Tilmann Walter focused on early modern physicians' letters in Germany between 1500 and 1700. Their personal experiences and how they reflected their emotions in letters was the main theme of the talk. Oswald Myconius, Joachim Vodian, Erasmus of Rotterdam, and Johannes Posthius were among those whose letters were examined by Walter. Walter also touched upon the crucial role of insomnia in the lives of those scholars as most of them wrote their books at nights.

Brita Planck - *The rhetoric of love: emotional markers in aristocratic letters of proposal in*

eighteenth-century Sweden

In her analysis of the language of love reflected in aristocratic letters of eighteenth-century Sweden, Brita Planck demonstrated that different themes could be included in letters ranging from marriage of love to passion. Some of the letters are defined as stereotype letters in which the main theme is the question of “how a woman should be”. Planck argued that love was defined in feelings rather than actions.

Eva Johanna Holmberg - The ‘Nature’ and ‘Character’ of Ottoman minorities in Early Modern English travellers’ texts

Eva Johanna Holmberg examined the ‘nature’ and ‘character’ of Ottoman minorities through the eyes of English travellers. These travellers focused on how living in a multi-ethnic and multi-religious empire affected the language, customs, and religious affairs of minorities. They referred to concepts such as civility, level of freedom, and level of religiosity to describe the nature of minorities. Main problems of the minorities according to the travellers were lack of education and forgetting their social roots.

XI.SESSION: Conceptual Perspectives (Chairperson: Mehmet Kalpaklı)

Sinai Rusinek – On Pre-Modern Concept of Envy

Challenging the conception of envy as a deeply embedded part of human nature, Sinai Rusinek argued that the concept of envy is a historical and cultural variable dependent on and constructed by the social, cultural, political and economic contexts in which it appears. Arguing that a western concept of envy was read into the ancient sources during the Early Modern period, Rusinek traced the hermeneutic gap through the choices of translators and interpreters of biblical texts. [from the abstracts]

Slobodan Dan Paich - Wellsprings & Sediment: reflections on traditional, popular, and early music: an approach to the cultural history of emotions

Slobodan Dan Paich discussed the significance of Dimitrie Cantemir whose seventeenth-century compositions are still in use today. Paich argued that Cantemir brought Armenian and Sephardic musical traditions together and that he was instrumental in the survival of these traditions to the present. Paich emphasized his extreme influence in the formation of theory and practice of seventeenth-century Ottoman classical music.

Sajjad Alam Rizvi - Sufi concept of love: Reception and interpretation in eighteenth-century South Asia

Focusing mainly on India, Sajjad Alam Rizvi discussed the interaction between Sufism and Hinduism in regards to the concept of love. Rizvi reminded that Ibn-i Arabi’s ideas and poetries about Rumi were spread through South Asia as Indian Sufis tried to interpret Hinduism in Sufi terms. Rizvi dwelled on the definitions and employment of two specific terms for two different kinds of love: *muhabbet* used for human love and “*ışk/aşk*” for passionate/ excessive love of humans for God. Rizvi also touched upon the Wahabi Movement in India which claimed that love of the intimate came from God, a conception borrowed from Ghazali without taking into account his notion of beauty.

Gönül Bakay - Jonathan Swift and Bitterness

Gönül Bakay examined the reflections of bitterness, which was regarded as an ugly emotion, in the works of Jonathan Swift. Bakay demonstrated that the concept was generally used when there was nothing one could do to change an unfavorable situation, while in the case of Jonathan Swift it was used in his critique of English colonial policies regarding the treatment of the Irish. Bakay emphasized the bitterness of Swift's essays.

Rachel Sternberg – *Pity in Ancient Greece*

Rachel Sternberg started her analysis of Greek folk psychology of pity with a clarification of the core meaning of Greek words that expressed pity, namely *oiktos* and *eleos*. Drawing largely on the works of Herodotus and Demosthenes, Sternberg discussed the sense perceptions that trigger the feelings, its relation to weeping and tears, and the locus of pity within the human body. [from the abstract]

**XII.SESSION: Love and affection – relational perspectives
(Chairperson: Selim Kuru)**

Andrea Griesebner – *Encoding/decoding of emotions in ecclesiastical court proceedings (1600-1783)*

Claudia Jarzebowski - *Children of love: emotions and relations in Early Modern History*

Claudia Jarzebowski demonstrated the connection between the history of emotion and political history. Jarzebowski dwelled on the civilizing process in manners. One of the main focuses of the talk was children violence.

Katharine Hodgkin - *'Love me or kill me, brother': sibling relationships in early modern life-writing*

In her examination of how sibling relationships were reflected in early modern life and writing, Katharine Hodgkin identified two extreme types of emotions prevalent between siblings: love and hate. Some main figures whom she focused on are Dionys Fitzherbert (1530-1643) and Elizabeth Isham (1609-54). She addressed the autobiography of Fitzherbert as an important source in order to have idea about sibling relationships. The word sibling was started to be used in late 19th century, before that is it was always brother and sister were used. Like relations between husband and wife, also the relation between sister and brother were an idealized form of friendship based on mutual confidence. But in households there was a hierarchy within family based on age, gender, or marriage which was prone to change.

Hakan Erdem - *'They Have Broken Hearts Due to the Troubles with their Masters': Discovering Slave Emotions in the Ottoman Empire*

Hakan Erdem argued that slaves acted as a kind of powerful incentive for emotions. When slaves wrote, especially the "elite slaves" who were employed and groomed by the elite to be part of the elite circle, they did not write about their own experiences. For example, Hürrem Sultan in her letters to Süleyman expressed her love towards him and how much she missed him, but never mentioned about her experiences. Thus, Erdem stressed the difficulty in finding a slave's voice except for the rare occasions when their voices are heard through court records. Erdem exemplified this rare occasion with the example of a slave girl who burnt down her master's house and explained her motives, thus her experiences and emotions. Erdem also touched upon the features of an ideal slave, in other words one who deserved compassion, kindness, and pity.

Richard Wittman - *“Love knows no bounds”: Overcoming religious constraints in seventeenth-century Ottoman legal practice*

Focusing on Galata, Karaköy, and Hasköy, Richard Wittman addressed to the rarity of emotions in legal texts. The neighborhoods in question were ethnically and culturally mixed. Wittmann presented a rare example found in a legal document involving a marital cheating case and argument on shamelessness. According to the document, a Muslim woman was accused of meeting with a Jewish man; the husband was asked to control his wife and his wife admitted that she was shameless.

**XIII.SESSION: Sorrow and Grief – representations in art, literature, and myth
(Chairperson: William Reddy)**

Jeehee Hong – *Mourning in person: Expressions of grief in middle-period Chinese funerary art*

In her speech, Jeehee Hong examined the social dimensions of visibility in Middle-period Chinese art (10th-14th centuries). She argued that this time period witnessed a growing number of visual representations of sorrow and grief. Hong highlighted that this phenomenon was unique to this time period. By doing so, she followed an inquiry of the social and cultural dimensions of the period which resulted as ritual and visual practices for particular emotions of sorrow and grief. [from the abstract]

Zeynep Yelçe – *Public display of grief: Sixteenth-century Ottoman royal funerals*

Focusing primarily on the funeral of Selim I (d. 1520), Zeynep Yelçe conceptualized the role of grief, especially the violent behavior associated with this particular emotion, within the process of succession and re-making of order. She compared the demonstrations of grief by various parties attending the funeral as well as that of the successor. She then compared the following sixteenth-century royal funerals to trace the changing attitude of the successor in the face of grief.

Edhem Eldem – *Sorrow and illness: “Modern” expressions of death in Ottoman Muslim epitaphs*

Edhem Eldem presented a thorough qualitative and quantitative survey of eighteenth- and nineteenth-century Ottoman epitaphs and traced the evolution of the writings on the tombstones toward more individualized texts.

Derya Gürses Tarbuck – *Eighteenth-century moral philosophy and the secularization of Melancholia*

Examining treatises dealing with melancholia, Derya Gürses Tarbuck discussed the secularization of melancholia. She emphasized that eighteenth-century philosophers increasingly regarded fear and pleasure as categories related with the body, and she associated this categorization with an escape from the metaphysical sphere. In this vein, she followed the issue in the methods of diagnosing and curing of melancholia. [from the abstract]

Marlene Kurz – *Melancholy: Western and Ottoman Varieties*

Marlene Kurz focused on the seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Ottoman interpretations and explanations of *sevda* and compare them with the Early Modern understanding of melancholy in Western Europe. [from the abstract]

XIV. SESSION: Anger, Fear, and Frightfulness (Chairperson: Laura Gianetti)

Virginia Langum - *Medieval wrath: Sin, passion, and pathology*

Virginia Langum discussed the perception of wrath by medieval theologians who believed both men and animals had passions, but in men these passions were ruled by reason and wit unlike animals. Langum explained that passions were defined as sufferings of will rather than its actions, and were considered as natural as seeing or hearing, some of them harmful some not. She focused on the association of wrath, an over passionate form of anger, with the soul and the body. Langum explained how, in the minds of the medieval writers, bodily symptoms corresponded to divine symptoms as exemplified in wrath as sin affects the soul and wrath produces constant fever.

Suraiya Faroghi - *Istanbul fires as reflected in Ottoman chronicles: Fear, hatred, suspicion and attempts to protect the legitimacy of the sultan*

Suraiya Faroghi discussed the seventeenth-century perception of fires as the wrath of God, emphasizing that during seventeenth century religious considerations were not separated from practical considerations. In the case of fires, she argued, practical proposals for preventing fire were not separated from those on how to prevent God's wrath, as they were interconnected. Another interrelated issue put forth by Faroghi was the contemporary fear of women as it was believed that whatever bad happened, it was the women's fault.